

COVID-19: Potential Implications for International Security Environment— Overview of Issues and Further Reading for Congress

Updated May 17, 2023

SUMMARY

R46336

May 17, 2023

Ronald O'Rourke Specialist in Naval Affairs

COVID-19: Potential Implications for International Security Environment—Overview of Issues and Further Reading for Congress

In the earlier months of the COVID-19 pandemic, some observers argued that the pandemic could be a world-changing event with potentially profound and long-lasting implications for the international security environment. Other observers were more skeptical that the pandemic would have such effects.

In reports issued in March 2021, April 2021, February 2022, and February 2023, the U.S. intelligence community provided assessments of potential or observed impacts of the pandemic on the international security environment.

Observers who discussed whether the pandemic would be world-changing for the international security environment focused on several areas of potential change, including the following, which are listed here separately but overlap in some cases and can interact with one another:

- world order, international institutions, and global governance;
- U.S. global leadership and the U.S. role in the world;
- China's potential role as a global leader;
- U.S. relations and great power competition with China and Russia;
- the relative prevalence of democratic and authoritarian or autocratic forms of government;
- societal tension, reform, transformation, and governmental stability in various countries;
- the world economy, globalization, and U.S. trade policy;
- allied defense spending and U.S. alliances;
- the cohesion of the European Union;
- the definition of, and budgeting for, U.S. national security;
- U.S. defense strategy, defense budgets, and military operations;
- U.S. foreign assistance programs, international debt relief, and refugee policy;
- activities of non-state actors;
- the amount of U.S. attention devoted to ongoing international issues other than the pandemic; and
- the role of Congress in setting and overseeing the execution of U.S. foreign and defense policy.

Issues for Congress include whether and how the pandemic has changed the international security environment and whether the Biden Administration's actions for responding to any such change are appropriate and sufficient. Congress's decisions regarding these issues could have significant implications for U.S. foreign and defense policy.

Contents

Introduction	l
Background	1
Assessments by U.S. Intelligence Community	1
March 2021 NIC Report on Global Trends	
April 2021 DNI Threat Assessment	3
February 2022 DNI Threat Assessment	4
February 2023 DNI Threat Assessment	
Overview of Areas of Potential Implications	
World Order, International Institutions, and Global Governance	
U.S. Global Leadership and Role in the World	10
China's Potential Role as a Global Leader	
U.S. Relations and Great Power Competition with China and Russia	
Democracy, Authoritarianism, and Autocracy	
Societal Tension, Reform, and Transformation, and Governmental Stability	
World Economy, Globalization, and U.S. Trade Policy	
Allied Defense Spending and U.S. Alliances	
European Union	
Definition of, and Budgeting for, U.S. National Security	
U.S. Defense Strategy, Defense Budget, and Military Operations	
U.S. Foreign Assistance, International Debt Relief, and Refugee Policy	
Non-state Actors	
U.S. Attention to International Issues Other than the Pandemic	
Role of Congress	
Appendices with CRS Reports and Additional Writings	
Potential Issues for Congress	14
A 10	
Appendixes	
Appendix A. Related CRS Reports	15
Appendix B. Additional Writings	
-th	
Contacts	
Author Information	47

Introduction

In the earlier months of the COVID-19 pandemic, some observers argued that the pandemic could be a world-changing event with potentially profound and long-lasting implications for the international security environment. Other observers were more skeptical that the pandemic would have such effects. This report provides a brief overview of some potential implications the pandemic might have for the international security environment, and appendices listing CRS reports and other writings for further reading.

Issues for Congress include whether and how the pandemic has changed the international security environment and whether the Biden Administration's actions for responding to any such change are appropriate and sufficient. Congress's decisions regarding these issues could have significant implications for U.S. foreign and defense policy.

Appendix A presents a list of CRS reports that provide more in-depth discussions of issues presented in this report. **Appendix B** presents a list of additional writings reflecting various perspectives on these issues.

Background

Assessments by U.S. Intelligence Community

In reports issued in March 2021, April 2021, February 2022, and February 2023, the U.S. intelligence community provided assessments of potential or observed impacts of the pandemic on the international security environment. Excerpts from these four reports are presented below.

March 2021 NIC Report on Global Trends

A March 2021 report of the National Intelligence Council (NIC)¹ on global trends—the 2021 edition of a report that NIC publishes every four years to serve as an unclassified strategic assessment on key trends that might shape the world over the next 20 years—includes a section on the potential impact of the pandemic, which states

The COVID-19 pandemic emerged globally in 2020, wreaking havoc across the world, killing more than 2.5 million people as of early 2021, devastating families and communities, and disrupting economies and political dynamics within and between countries. Previous global trends editions forecasted the potential for new diseases and even imagined scenarios with a pandemic, but we lacked a full picture of the breadth and depth of its disruptive potential. COVID-19 has shaken long-held assumptions about resilience and adaptation and created new uncertainties about the economy, governance, geopolitics, and technology.

To understand and assess the impact of this crisis, we examined and debated a broad range of our assumptions and assessments related to key global trends. We asked a series of

 $(Director\ of\ National\ Intelligence, ``National\ Intelligence\ Council--Who\ We\ Are, ``accessed\ July\ 9,\ 2021,\ at\ https://www.dni.gov/index.php/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=393&Itemid=778.)$

¹ The Office of the Director of National Intelligence states that the National Intelligence Council "supports the Director of National Intelligence [DNI] in his role as head of the Intelligence Community (IC) and is the IC's center for long-term strategic analysis. Since its establishment in 1979, the NIC has served as a bridge between the intelligence and policy communities, a source of deep substantive expertise on intelligence issues, and a facilitator of Intelligence Community collaboration and outreach. The NIC's National Intelligence Officers—drawn from government, academia, and the private sector—are the Intelligence Community's senior experts on a range of regional and functional issues."

questions: Which existing trends will endure, which trends are accelerating or decelerating because of the pandemic, and where are we likely to experience fundamental, systemic shifts? Are the disruptions temporary or could the pandemic unleash new forces to shape the future? Much like the terrorist attacks of 11 September 2001, the COVID-19 pandemic is likely to produce some changes that will be felt for years to come and change the way we live, work, and govern domestically and internationally. How great these will be, however, is very much in question.

ACCELERATING, SHARPENING SOME TRENDS

The pandemic and corresponding national responses appear to be honing and accelerating several trends that were already underway before the outbreak. COVID-19 brought global health and healthcare issues into sharp relief, exposed and in some cases widened social fissures, underscored vast disparities in healthcare access and infrastructure, and interrupted efforts to combat other diseases. The pandemic also highlighted weaknesses in the international coordination on health crises and the mismatch between existing institutions, funding levels, and future health challenges.

Catalyzing Economic Trends. Lockdowns, quarantines, and the closing of international borders have catalyzed some pre-existing economic trends, including diversification in global supply chains, increased national debt, and greater government intervention in economies. Moving forward, the character of globalization may retain some of the changes from this crisis period, and debt, particularly for developing economies, will strain national capacities for many years.

Reinforcing Nationalism and Polarization. Nationalism and polarization have been on the rise in many countries, especially exclusionary nationalism. Efforts to contain and manage the virus have reinforced nationalist trends globally as some states turned inward to protect their citizens and sometimes cast blame on marginalized groups. The response to the pandemic has fueled partisanship and polarization in many countries as groups argue over the best way to respond and seek scapegoats to blame for spreading the virus and for slow responses.

Deepening Inequality. The disproportionate economic impact of COVID-19 on low-income earners has caused them to fall further behind. When COVID-19 is finally controlled, many families are likely to have experienced further setbacks, especially those working in the service or informal sectors or who left the workforce to provide dependent care—predominantly women. The pandemic has exposed the digital divide within and between countries while spurring efforts to improve Internet access.

Straining Governance. The pandemic is straining government capacity for services and contributing to already low levels of trust in institutions in countries that have not effectively handled the response. The pandemic is exacerbating the confusing and polarized information environment that is undermining public confidence in health authorities, particularly in open societies. Illiberal regimes in some countries are using the pandemic as a pretext to more severely crack down on dissent and restrict civic freedoms, conditions that may outlive the disease.

Highlighting Failed International Cooperation. The COVID-19 pandemic exposed the weaknesses and political cleavages in international institutions, such as the World Health Organization (WHO) and United Nations, and called into question countries' ability and willingness to cooperate multilaterally to address common challenges beyond infectious disease, particularly climate change. The WHO, which has faced significant funding difficulties and resistance to mandatory surveillance regimes, is facing its gravest shock in nearly two decades. The crisis, however, may ultimately lead actors to make deeper reforms, standardize data collection and sharing, and forge new public-private partnerships.

Elevating the Role of Nonstate Actors. Nonstate actors, ranging from the Gates Foundation to private companies, have been crucial to vaccine research or retrofitting equipment to mass produce medical supplies and personal protective equipment. Nonstate networks will complement national and intergovernmental action in future health crises, including early warning, treatment, facilitation of data-sharing, and vaccine development.

WHILE OTHERS DECELERATE OR REVERSE

COVID-19 is slowing and possibly reversing some longstanding trends in human development, especially the reduction of poverty and disease and closing gender inequality gaps. The longest lasting reversals may be in poverty reduction across Africa, Latin America, and South Asia, followed by losses in gender equality. The resources devoted to fighting COVID-19 and social restrictions could reverse years of progress against malaria, measles, polio, and other infectious diseases by consuming key financial, material, and personnel resources.

The COVID-19 emergency may bring regions together in ways that previous crises have

Although European countries early in the crisis imposed restrictions on border traffic and exports of critical medical supplies, the European Union has rallied around an economic rescue package and other emergency measures that could bolster the European integration project going forward. COVID-19 could also lead to redirection of national budgets toward pandemic response and economic recovery, diverting funds from defense expenditures, foreign aid, and infrastructure programs in some countries, at least in the near term.

MORE QUESTIONS THAN ANSWERS

The unanticipated second- and third-order effects of the COVID-19 pandemic have reminded us how uncertain the future is—both in the long and short term. As researchers and analysts, we must be ever vigilant, asking better questions, frequently challenging our assumptions, checking our biases, and looking for weak signals of change. We need to expect the unexpected and apply the lessons of this pandemic to our craft in the future.²

April 2021 DNI Threat Assessment

An April 9, 2021, report from the Director of National Intelligence (DNI)—DNI's annual threat assessment for 2021—includes a section on the pandemic that states (emphasis as in the original):

The COVID-19 pandemic has disrupted life worldwide, with far-reaching effects that extend well beyond global health to the economic, political, and security spheres. We expect COVID-19 to remain a threat to populations worldwide until vaccines and therapeutics are widely distributed. The economic and political implications of the pandemic will ripple through the world for years.

The pandemic is raising geopolitical tensions, and great powers are jockeying for advantage and influence. States are struggling to cooperate—and in some cases are undermining cooperation—to respond to the pandemic and its economic fallout, particularly as some governments turn inward and question the merits of globalization and interdependence. Some governments, such as China and Russia, are using offers of medical supplies and vaccines to try to boost their geopolitical standing.

The economic fallout from the pandemic is likely to create or worsen instability in at least a few—and perhaps many—countries, as people grow more desperate in the face of interlocking pressures that include sustained economic downturns, job losses, and disrupted supply chains. Some hard-hit developing countries are experiencing financial

² National Intelligence Council, Global Trends 2040, A More Contested World, March 2021, pp. 11-13.

and humanitarian crises, increasing the risk of surges in migration, collapsed governments, or internal conflict.

- Although global trade shows signs of bouncing back from the COVID-19-induced slump, economists caution that any recovery this year could be disrupted by ongoing or expanding pandemic effects, keeping pressure on many governments to focus on internal economic stability. In April, the International Monetary Fund estimated that the global economy would grow 6 percent this year and 4.4 percent in 2022. This year's forecast is revised up 0.5 percentage points relative to the previous forecast, reflecting expectations of vaccine-powered strengthening of activity later in the year and additional policy support in a few large economies. The global growth contraction for 2020 is estimated at 3.3 percent.
- The resurgence in COVID-19 infections early this year may have an even greater economic impact as struggling businesses in hard-hit sectors such as tourism and restaurants fold and governments face increasing budget strains.
- The effects on developing countries—especially those that rely heavily on remittances, tourism, or oil exports—may be severe and longer lasting; many developing countries already have sought debt relief.
- The economic fallout from the COVID-19 pandemic, along with conflict and weather extremes, has driven food insecurity worldwide to its highest point in more than a decade, which increases the risk of instability. The number of people experiencing high levels of acute food insecurity doubled from 135 million in 2019 to about 270 million last year, and is projected to rise to 330 million by yearend.

The COVID-19 pandemic is prompting shifts in security priorities for countries around the world. As militaries face growing calls to cut budgets, gaps are emerging in UN peacekeeping operations; military training and preparedness; counterterrorism operations; and arms control monitoring, verification, and compliance. These gaps are likely to grow without a quick end to the pandemic and a rapid recovery, making managing conflict more difficult—particularly because the pandemic has not caused any diminution in the number or intensity of conflicts.

COVID-19-related disruptions to essential health services—such as vaccinations, aid delivery, and maternal and child health programs—will increase the likelihood of additional health emergencies, especially among vulnerable populations in low-income countries. As examples, the pandemic has disrupted HIV/AIDS treatments and preventative measures in Sub-Saharan Africa, as well as measles and polio vaccination campaigns in dozens of countries. World populations, including Americans, will remain vulnerable to new outbreaks of infectious diseases as risk factors persist, such as rapid and unplanned urbanization, protracted conflict and humanitarian crises, human incursions into previously unsettled land, expansion of international travel and trade, and public mistrust of government and health care workers.³

February 2022 DNI Threat Assessment

A February 7, 2022, report from DNI—DNI's annual threat assessment for 2022⁴—refers in its foreword to "the continued global disruption resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic" and further states in the foreword:

-

³ Office of the Director of National Intelligence, *Annual Threat Assessment of the US Intelligence Community*, April 9, 2021, pp. 17-18.

⁴ Office of the Director of National Intelligence, *Annual Threat Assessment of the US Intelligence Community*, February 7, 2022, 30 pp.

The lingering effects of the COVID-19 pandemic will continue to strain governments and societies, fueling humanitarian and economic crises, political unrest, and geopolitical competition as countries, such as China and Russia, seek advantage through such avenues as "vaccine diplomacy." No country has been completely spared, and even when a vaccine is widely distributed globally, the economic and political aftershocks will be felt for years. Low-income countries with high debts face particularly challenging recoveries and the potential for cascading crises leading to regional instability, whereas others will turn inward or be distracted by other challenges. The IC [U.S. intelligence community] continues to investigate the concerning incidences of Anomalous Health Incidents and the danger they pose to U.S. personnel. (Page 4)

The report includes a section focusing on the impacts of the pandemic that states (emphasis as in the original):

INFECTIOUS DISEASES AND THE IMPACT OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC

The COVID-19 pandemic has killed millions of people and disrupted life worldwide, with far-reaching effects extending well beyond global health to the economic, political, and societal spheres. Although the most severe health impacts of COVID-19 are lessening as global vaccination coverage increases and natural immunity builds, countries worldwide will continue to grapple with COVID-19 during the next year. The socioeconomic and political implications of the pandemic will ripple through the world for years.

The economic fallout from the pandemic is likely to continue to challenge governments and hold back human development and wellbeing, particularly in low-income countries. Societal discontent resulting from these conditions could worsen instability in some countries and fuel surges in international migration, as people grow more desperate in the face of interlocking pressures that include sustained economic downturns.

- The COVID-19 pandemic will continue to increase debt burdens, constrain government spending by poor countries, and cause persistent job insecurity, in turn undermining economic and political stability, particularly in low-income countries. Although global trade shows signs of bouncing back from the COVID-19-induced slump, economists caution that any recovery this year could be disrupted by ongoing or expanding pandemic effects, keeping pressure on many governments to focus on internal economic stability.
- The economic fallout from COVID-19, combined with conflict and weather extremes, has driven hunger worldwide to its highest point in more than a decade, which increases the risk of instability. The number of people facing acute food insecurity doubled from 135 million in 2019 to more than 270 million in 2020, and is projected to continue rising.

COVID-19 is likely to continue to strain health systems and create conditions that could facilitate the spread of other infectious diseases globally, including to the U.S. homeland.

- The pandemic has significantly disrupted essential health services—for example, causing healthcare worker shortages, delays in non-emergency procedures, or avoidance of healthcare facilities because of fears of becoming infected with COVID-19—which are likely to worsen health outcomes and continue to hamper countries' abilities to control disease, particularly low and middle-income countries.
- Influenza and other seasonal respiratory diseases could surge to abnormally high levels in 2022 with the reduction of COVID-19 mitigation measures, which have dampened circulation of these diseases since early 2020, and in turn reduced the level of population immunity to these infections.

Countries globally remain vulnerable to the emergence of a novel pathogen that could cause a devastating new pandemic. Drivers for disease emergence persist and are on the rise, including deforestation and other human encroachment into unsettled land, wildlife harvesting and trade, livestock production, and climate change. These drivers are

compounded by factors that facilitate global spread, such as international travel and trade, inadequate global disease surveillance and control, distrust of public health authorities, health disinformation, and health system strain brought on by the COVID-19 pandemic. Emerging agricultural diseases—even those that do not harm humans directly—threaten to cause immense economic damage and disruption to food supplies if they spread globally or into new regions. (Pages 18-19)

The report elsewhere includes additional statements that refer to the pandemic, including the following (emphasis as in the original):

- "We will see continuing potential for surges in migration from Afghanistan, Latin America, and other poor countries, which are reeling from conflict and the economic fallout of the COVID-19 pandemic." (Page 5)
- "China will continue spreading COVID-19 misinformation and downplaying its early failures while casting blame on the West. Its misinformation includes claims that the United States created COVID-19." (Page 8)
- "Russia also uses its capabilities in COVID-19 vaccine development and civilian nuclear reactor construction as a soft-power tool in its foreign policy." (Page 11)
- "[North Korean leader Kim Jong Un] probably does not view the current level of pressure on his regime, the economic hardships resulting from sanctions and his domestic COVID-19 countermeasures as enough to require a fundamental change in approach." (Page 16)
- "The IC continues to investigate how SARS-CoV-2, the virus that causes COVID-19, first infected humans.... Beijing continues to hinder the global investigation, resist sharing information, and blame other countries, including the United States." (Page 19)
- Global shortcomings in preparedness for the pandemic and questions surrounding the origins of the COVID-19 virus and biosecurity may inspire some adversaries to consider options related to biological weapons developments.
 - As China, Iran, and Russia continue to publicly tout individual or collaborative efforts to improve biosecurity, they have pushed narratives that further drive threat perceptions, including linking U.S. laboratories abroad to COVID-19 origins, breaches in biosafety, untrustworthy vaccines, and biological weapons. This messaging probably will be amplified in the lead up to the once-every-five-years Review Conference of the Biological and Toxin Weapons Convention, tentatively slated to convene in mid-2022. (Page 19)
- "In the Western Hemisphere, factors such as longstanding poor socioeconomic conditions, perceived changes in U.S. immigration policy, and employment opportunities in the United States will continue to drive migration to the Mexico-U.S. border; a growing number of people from around the world see transiting Mexico as a way to reach the United States..... Eased COVID-19-related travel restrictions and perceptions of greater job opportunities in a recovering U.S. economy are contributing to a rise in migration. These dynamics, along with perceptions of U.S. immigration policies, will determine the flow of migrants this year." (Pages 24-25)
- "Economic disparities and the effects of conflict and extreme weather will encourage internal and international migration and refugee flows. Migration and displacement will heighten humanitarian needs, increase the risk of political upheaval, exacerbate the risk of other health crises, and aid

recruitment and radicalization by militant groups—particularly as COVID-19 strains global humanitarian response mechanisms." (Page 25)

- "A majority of Afghans are suffering food insecurity because of the effects of conflict, drought, and COVID-19 disruptions, and further deterioration almost certainly will increase internal displacement, which could lead to international migration. Refugee flows could spike if the Taliban attempted to relieve pressure by allowing larger populations to leave Afghanistan or conditions sharply deteriorated." (Page 28)
- "The Middle East will remain a region characterized by persistent conflict, with active insurgencies in several countries, sparring between Iran and other countries, and terrorism and protest movements sparking occasional violence. Domestic volatility will persist as popular discontent and socioeconomic grievances continue to rise, particularly as the region contends with the economic fallout from the COVID-19 pandemic, increasing the risk of internal or international conflict that would threaten U.S. persons and national security interests." (Page 29)
- "Burma's security and economic conditions probably will continue to deteriorate because both the regime and the opposition are relying on the use of force in an attempt to break the ongoing political stalemate and advance their respective positions. Both sides remain entrenched in their positions and neither are able to decisively prevail. Economic deterioration and ongoing violence in addition to the ongoing COVID-19-pandemic will amplify the country's deteriorating humanitarian conditions, such as population displacement, food insecurity, and a poorly functioning health care system." (Page 30)
- "Latin America and the Caribbean almost certainly will see hotspots of volatility in the coming year, undermining or distracting reliable U.S. partners from improving living conditions, tackling illicit flows, addressing climate change, and warding off foreign influence. In many cases, the COVID-19 pandemic has intensified high levels of public discontent with worsening longstanding poor socioeconomic conditions and public services that manifested in large anti-government protests. Elevated levels of U.S.-bound migration from Latin America and the Caribbean region will persist into at least mid-2022 because the underlying economic and insecurity drivers will remain unchanged, and migrants view the U.S. labor market and immigration policies and enforcement as favorable." (Page 30)
- "Sub-Saharan African governments will exhibit clear agency in their foreign affairs as the international community recognizes the importance of the region to its economic and security interests. Large numbers of U.S. citizens will be at risk from conflict in several countries. As the region seeks to reinvigorate its upward trajectory following the social and economic effects of the COVID-19 pandemic, it will continue to face unstable commodities prices, poor service delivery and endemic corruption, stresses of extreme weather events, and insecurity because of terrorism, insurgency, sectarian violence, and political instability." (Page 30)

February 2023 DNI Threat Assessment

A February 6, 2023, report from DNI—DNI's annual threat assessment for 2023⁵— includes a section focusing on the impacts of the pandemic that states (emphasis as in the original):

INFECTIOUS DISEASES AND THE IMPACT OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC

Now entering its fourth year, the COVID-19 pandemic remains one of the most significant threats to global public health, at a cost of more than 6.5 million lives lost and trillions of dollars in lost economic output to date. Despite the gradual decline of the most severe health effects of COVID-19 because of the greater availability of vaccines globally, increased natural immunity, and better treatments, significant challenges remain as countries now are responding to new variants, waning vaccine protection, gaps in vaccine coverage, challenges in management of public health safety measures, and growing misinformation campaigns aimed at sowing doubt and discrediting public health institutions worldwide. In addition to direct effects of the pandemic, resultant economic, human security, political, and national security implications of COVID-19 continue to strain recovery efforts, presenting both known and unforeseen challenges that probably will ripple through society and the global economy during the next year and for years to come.

- During the next year, pandemic-related higher debt burdens, constrained government spending, and ongoing employment disruptions and insecurity are expected to heighten the risk of financial instability and poverty, particularly in low-income countries and those recovering from the most severe economic effects of COVID-19.
- The combination of economic and human security challenges resulting from COVID-19 probably will further strain capacities of governments to meet public demands during the next year and for years to come, particularly when combined with the need to address similar challenges arising from climate change. The potential for public discontent and societal divisions will grow, and risks to democratic governance, political stability, and migration fluctuations in some countries will increase.
- Despite some improvement during the last year, pandemic effects continue to challenge the delivery of essential health services—in some cases because of healthcare worker shortages, delays in non-emergency procedures, or avoidance to seek healthcare because of misinformation or fears of becoming infected with COVID-19. The factors probably will continue to contribute to poor health outcomes and hamper countries' abilities to control disease, particularly low- and middle-income countries.

Countries globally remain vulnerable to the emergence or introduction of a novel pathogen that could cause a devastating new pandemic. Drivers for disease emergence persist and are on the rise, including climate change, deforestation, human encroachment into previously undisturbed habitats, wildlife harvesting and trade, mass food production, and lack of international consensus on biosafety norms. These drivers are compounded by factors that facilitate global spread, such as international travel and trade, inadequate global disease surveillance and control, distrust of public health authorities, health disinformation, and health system strain brought on by the COVID-19 pandemic. Emerging agricultural and livestock diseases and antimicrobial resistance—although not necessarily involving pathogens of pandemic concern—threaten to cause immense economic damage and disruption to food supplies if they spread globally or into new regions.

— A lack of global field biosafety standards and protective measures continues to raise concerns of viral spillover worldwide. Increased interest in field sampling and advanced biological research since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, poor training, and lack of

⁵ Office of the Director of National Intelligence, *Annual Threat Assessment of the US Intelligence Community*, February 6, 2023, 39 pp.

international inspection and standardized regulatory requirements have all been implicated in contributing to the risk of contamination and/or breaches in biocontainment.

Our Assessment of the Origins of COVID-19

The IC continues to investigate how SARS-CoV-2, the virus that causes COVID-19, first infected humans, maintaining a Community of Interest across agencies. All agencies assess that two hypotheses are plausible explanations for the origin of COVID-19: natural exposure to an infected animal and a laboratory-associated incident.

— Beijing continues to hinder the global investigation, resist sharing information, and blame other countries, including the United States. (Pages 24-25)

The report elsewhere includes additional statements that refer to the pandemic, including the following (emphasis as in the original):

- "Russia has used its capabilities in COVID-19 vaccine development and the nuclear power export industry as foreign policy tools." (Page 13)
- "North Korea's COVID-19 restrictions and reliance on the Korean People's Army (KPA) to enforce and execute some pandemic countermeasures probably have caused overall KPA combat readiness to decline in the near term, but key units probably will remain capable of executing their wartime missions." (Page 20)
- "Global shortcomings in preparedness for the COVID-19 pandemic and concerns with biosecurity, fabricated public claims about U.S. biological weapons development fueled by U.S. adversaries, as well as continued questions surrounding the origins of the COVID-19 virus, may inspire some adversaries to consider options related to the development of biological weapons. China, Iran, North Korea, and Russia continue to publicly push false narratives that may drive global threat perceptions of biological weapons, including linking U.S. laboratories abroad to COVID-19 origins, breaches in biosafety, untrustworthy vaccines, and biological weapons." (Page 25)
- "Russia's aggression against Ukraine has aggravated COVID-19-related fragilities in the global economy, raised commodity prices, fueled market volatility, and contributed to food insecurity and financial instability, particularly in low-income countries." (Page 28)
- "Russia's war in Ukraine coupled with the COVID-19 pandemic has increased poverty, hindered economic growth, and widened inequality, raising the conditions that are ripe for domestic unrest, insurgencies, democratic backsliding, and authoritarianism." (Page 34)
- "Russia's war in Ukraine coupled with the COVID-19 pandemic has increased poverty, hindered economic growth, and widened inequality, raising the conditions that are ripe for domestic unrest, insurgencies, democratic backsliding, and authoritarianism." (Page 38)

Overview of Areas of Potential Implications

Areas of potential change reflected in writings from observers who have discussed whether the pandemic will be a world-changing event include but are not limited to those discussed below. Although these areas of potential change are presented separately, they overlap in some cases and can interact with one another.

World Order, International Institutions, and Global Governance

Some observers focused on whether the pandemic could cause or accelerate changes to the U.S.-led liberal international order that has operated since World War II, to the international institutions and norms that contribute to it, and consequently to global governance.⁶ Changes to the international order and its supporting institutions and norms could affect the international context for addressing not only the pandemic, but other international issues as well.

U.S. Global Leadership and Role in the World

The pandemic could influence discussions over the costs and benefits to the United States of acting as a global leader, not only with respect to global health but across a range of issues.

In the earlier months of the pandemic, some observers focused on how the pandemic may have illustrated the strengths or weaknesses of the Trump Administration's "America First" approach to the U.S. role in the world. Some observers argued that the pandemic demonstrated that the United States was maintaining or reasserting its role as global leader, while others argued that the pandemic demonstrated that the United States chose to withdraw from or was no longer capable of performing that role, and that the pandemic was the first major international crisis since World War II for which the United States did not serve as the leader for spearheading, organizing, or implementing an international response.

Other observers argued that the U.S. response to the pandemic focused international attention on what they view as a need for reform at the World Health Organization (WHO), demonstrated the strength and innovativeness of the U.S. scientific and pharmaceutical establishments in terms of developing and manufacturing vaccines, and demonstrated the flexibility and resiliency of the U.S. federal system in terms of permitting states and localities to respond to the pandemic in ways that were tailored to local conditions.

Some observers, including some foreign observers, argued that the U.S. domestic response to the pandemic demonstrated weaknesses in U.S. democracy, governance, and public health, particularly in comparison to how certain other countries responded to the pandemic within their own borders, and that this could reduce the ability of the United States in the future to offer itself or be accepted by other countries as a global leader on other international issues or as a model for other countries to emulate. As vaccines became more widely available in the United States, some observers argued that the United States should export larger numbers of vaccine doses to other countries that need them so as to demonstrate U.S. global leadership and help protect U.S. public health and the U.S. economy by helping to end the global pandemic more quickly.

Other terms used to refer to the U.S.-led liberal international order include *postwar international order*, *rules-based international order*, and *open international order*. Observers sometimes substitute *world* for *international*, or omit *international* or *world* and refer simply to the *liberal order*, the *U.S.-led order*, and so on. In the terms *liberal international order* and *liberal order*, the word *liberal* does not refer to the conservative-liberal construct often used in discussing contemporary politics in the United States or other countries. It is, instead, an older use of the term that refers to an order based on the rule of law, as opposed to an order based on the arbitrary powers of hereditary monarchs.

Though often referred to as if it is a fully developed or universally established situation, the liberal international order, like other international orders that preceded it, is incomplete in geographic reach and in other ways; partly aspirational; not fixed in stone, but rather subject to evolution over time; sometimes violated by its supporters; not entirely free of might-makes-right behavior; resisted or rejected by certain states and non-state actors; and subject to various stresses and challenges.

_

⁶ The term *international order* or *world order* generally refers in foreign policy discussions to the collection of organizations, institutions, treaties, rules, norms, and practices that are intended to organize, structure, and regulate international relations during a given historical period.

China's Potential Role as a Global Leader

Some observers focused on whether the pandemic provided insight into whether China desires and is working to become a global leader on par with (or in the place of) the United States, to what degree China has a capacity for doing so, and how other countries might view China acting in such a role. China's transparency, particularly regarding the origin of the COVID-19 virus, China's actions in the early days of its COVID-19 outbreak in Wuhan, trial data on the efficacy of China's vaccines, as well as China's actions to send vaccines, other medical supplies, and medical personnel to other countries, perhaps for political or diplomatic purposes, became elements of a broader ongoing discussion regarding China's capacity or suitability for acting as a global leader.

U.S. Relations and Great Power Competition with China and Russia

Some observers focused on how the pandemic became an element in U.S-China relations, and in U.S. great power competition with China and Russia. For some observers, the pandemic presented an opportunity for U.S.-China cooperation on an important international issue of common interest. For other observers, the pandemic became a source of dispute and an arena of competition between the two countries, and contributed to a hardening of U.S.-China relations into a Cold War-like adversarial situation.

In the earlier months of the pandemic, some observers focused on what they viewed as a competition or race between the United States, China, Russia, and other countries to develop, manufacture, and administer effective vaccines, and thus be able to restore their economies to full operation sooner than other countries. Some observers focused on whether China and Russia were attempting to use exports of their vaccines as levers to gain advantages in their relations with recipient countries. The terms *vaccine nationalism* and *vaccine diplomacy* were used by some of these observers to refer to such perceived activities. Some observers expressed concern that decisions by countries to pursue vaccine development and deployment in a competitive, individual manner rather than a cooperative, multilateral manner could reduce the overall effectiveness of efforts to develop, manufacture, and administer effective vaccines and thereby prolong the global pandemic.

Some observers focused on the pandemic as a factor in the discussion of whether the United States should decouple its economy from China's and reduce its dependence on China for key materials and products, including hospital supplies and pharmaceuticals. Other observers focused on whether the U.S. and Chinese responses to the pandemic will affect views around the world regarding the relative merits of the U.S. and Chinese forms of government and economic models as potential examples to emulate.

Democracy, Authoritarianism, and Autocracy

Related to the point above about forms of government, some observers focused on the potential impact of the pandemic on discussions in various countries regarding the merits of democracy compared to those of other forms of government. Other observers focused on whether the pandemic provided national leaders with an opportunity or rationale for taking actions to seize greater power and move their countries away from democracy and toward authoritarianism or autocracy, or strengthen or consolidate their already-existing authoritarian or autocratic forms of government.

Societal Tension, Reform, and Transformation, and Governmental Stability

Beyond the specific point above about potential movement toward greater authoritarianism and autocracy, some observers focused on the possibility that the pandemic more generally could cause increased social tensions in certain countries, could lead to (or present opportunities for) societal reforms and transformations, or could destabilize and perhaps cause the downfall of governments, akin to the effects of certain past world-changing events, such as World War I.⁷ Such changes could alter the political orientations, national strategies, foreign policies, and defense policies of the countries in which they occur, potentially inducing follow-on effects among governments and other global actors that interact with those countries.

World Economy, Globalization, and U.S. Trade Policy

Some observers focused on how the pandemic could change the world economy, perhaps in ways that could influence the international security environment. Noting that the pandemic affected world trade volumes and disrupted and altered global supply chains, they focused on the question of whether economic globalization would as a result be slowed, halted, reversed, or otherwise changed. Some observers monitored or discussed how such effects could influence or be influenced by U.S. trade policy.

Allied Defense Spending and U.S. Alliances

Particularly during the earlier months of the pandemic, some observers focused on the possibility that costs incurred by U.S. allies—particularly NATO allies in Europe—to support their economies during stay-at-home/lockdown periods could lead to offsetting reductions in their defense expenditures. More generally, some observers during the earlier months of the pandemic asked whether reductions in economic growth caused by the pandemic could lead to reductions in the defense budgets of U.S. allies in both Europe and Asia.

European Union

In the earlier months of the pandemic, some observers focused on the question of whether the pandemic was creating tensions—or, conversely, opportunities for greater coordination—among the European Union member states, and what impact the pandemic might ultimately have on the cohesion of the European Union and its ability to take effective actions on the international stage.

Definition of, and Budgeting for, U.S. National Security

Some observers focused on whether the pandemic would (or should) lead to a revised definition of U.S. national security, particularly one that is less military-centric and more focused on what are sometimes called human-security-oriented challenges or global issues, such as climate

⁷ For brief discussions of the impacts of World War I on societies and governments, see, for example, Robert Wilde,

[&]quot;The Consequences of World War I, Political and Social Effects of the War to End All Wars," *ThoughtCo.*, July 10, 2019; John Horne, "The First World War: the Aftermath, The Years Following the End of the War Were Marked by More Wars, Political Upheaval and Deep Social Change," *Irish Times*, April 24, 2018; Steven Mintz, "Historical Context: The Global Effect of World War I," *History Now (Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History)*, undated, accessed April 16, 2020; Margaret MacMillan, "World War I: The War That Changed Everything," *Wall Street Journal*, June 20, 2014; Steven Erlanger, "The War to End All Wars? Hardly. But It Did Change Them Forever." *New York Times*, June 26, 2014; Jay Winter, "How the Great War Shaped the World," *Atlantic*, World War Lissue.

York Times, June 26, 2014; Jay Winter, "How the Great War Shaped the World," Atlantic, World War I issue (September 29, 2014); Kathleen Haley, "100 Years after WWI: The Lasting Impacts of the Great War," Media, Law & Policy (Syracuse University), July 28, 2014; "Aftermath of World War I," Wikipedia, updated April 11, 2020, accessed April 16, 2020.

change, that have sometimes been more at the periphery of U.S. national security policy and plans. Such a change in definition could lead to a changed allocation of funding between the Department of Defense (DOD) and other government agencies that perform national-security-related tasks, a realignment of resources within DOD between combat-oriented programs and other programs (such as those related to DOD's mission of providing defense support of civil authorities), and perhaps a changed allocation of funding among the agencies other than DOD that perform national-security-related tasks.

U.S. Defense Strategy, Defense Budget, and Military Operations

Particularly during the earlier months of the pandemic, some observers focused on the question of whether large federal expenditures made in response to the domestic U.S. economic effects of the pandemic, and the impact of these expenditures on the federal budget deficit and federal debt, could lead to greater constraints in coming years on U.S. defense spending levels. As a follow-on matter, these observers additionally focused on the question of whether responding to such increased constraints would (or should) lead to revisions in U.S. defense strategy, changes in U.S. defense programs, and a reduction or termination of certain overseas U.S. military operations.

U.S. Foreign Assistance, International Debt Relief, and Refugee Policy

Some observers focused on the question of whether the pandemic provided a new lens through which to measure the value of U.S. foreign assistance, international debt relief, and refugee policy in promoting U.S. interests, particularly in connection with the previously mentioned issue of whether to revise the definition of U.S. national security to make it less military-centric.

Non-state Actors

Some observers focused on how non-state actors such as international terrorist and criminal organizations were reacting to the pandemic, and on how much priority should be given to countering such actors in the future, particularly in a context of a changed definition of U.S. national security.

U.S. Attention to International Issues Other than the Pandemic

Particularly during the earlier months of the pandemic, some observers focused on whether responding to the pandemic was affecting the time and resources that U.S. leaders and agencies could devote to addressing other international issues of concern to the United States that predated but continued to exist in parallel with the pandemic. In the earlier months of the pandemic, U.S. officials warned other countries to not take actions during the pandemic to challenge U.S. interests around the world or otherwise test U.S. resolve or responsiveness on the thinking that the pandemic was distracting the U.S. government from other concerns or reducing U.S. capacity for responding to any such challenges.

Role of Congress

In the earlier months of the pandemic, a few observers focused on the issue of how the pandemic had affected Congress's activities for conducting oversight of the Administration's foreign policy actions.

Appendices with CRS Reports and Additional Writings

For further reading on the topics outlined above, see the CRS reports presented in **Appendix A** and the additional writings presented in **Appendix B**.

Potential Issues for Congress

Potential issues for Congress regarding implications of the pandemic for the international security environment and the U.S. role in the world include but are not limited to the following:

- Has the pandemic change the international security environment, and if so, in what ways? What insight into that question, if any, can be provided by past major world events such as World Wars I and II and the 1918 influenza pandemic?
- How should the United States respond to changes in the international security environment that may have been caused by the pandemic?
- What has the pandemic demonstrated about the role of the United States as a global leader? What impact, if any, will the U.S. domestic response to the pandemic have on the ability of the United States in the future to offer itself or be accepted by other countries as a global leader on other international issues, or to serve as a model for other countries to emulate in terms of their own political systems, governance, and economic models?
- What actions did the Administration develop to respond to changes in the
 international security environment that may have been caused by the pandemic?
 Did Congress have sufficient visibility into these actions? Were these actions
 appropriate and sufficient? What metrics should Congress use to assess them?
- What implications, if any, do changes in the international security environment that may have been caused by the pandemic have for the role of Congress in setting and overseeing the execution of U.S. foreign and defense policy, or for congressional organization and operations?

Appendix A. Related CRS Reports

CRS reports that provide more in-depth discussions of specific issues discussed in this report include the following, which are presented in alphabetical order of their titles:⁸

- CRS Insight IN11198, *Bolivia's October 2020 General Elections*, by Clare Ribando Seelke.
- CRS Legal Sidebar LSB10525, Can the United States Sue China over COVID-19 in an International Court?, by Stephen P. Mulligan.
- CRS In Focus IF11532, Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Impact in Africa, coordinated by Alexis Arieff.
- CRS Report R46209, *Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Pandemic: CRS Experts*, by Matthew B. Barry. (Includes a section listing CRS experts on international response activities relating to the COVD-19 pandemic.)
- CRS Report R46354, COVID-19 and China: A Chronology of Events (December 2019-January 2020), by Susan V. Lawrence.
- CRS Insight IN11496, COVID-19 and Emerging Global Patterns of Financial Crime, by Liana W. Rosen.
- CRS In Focus IF11606, COVID-19 and Foreign Assistance: Congressional Oversight Framework and Current Activities, by Nick M. Brown and Emily M. Morgenstern.
- CRS In Focus IF11496, COVID-19 and Foreign Assistance: Issues for Congress, by Nick M. Brown, Marian L. Lawson, and Emily M. Morgenstern.
- CRS In Focus IF11575, COVID-19 and Global Food Security: Issues for Congress, by Alyssa R. Casey and Emily M. Morgenstern.
- CRS Insight IN11288, COVID-19 and the Defense Industrial Base: DOD Response and Legislative Considerations, by Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS Insight IN11279, COVID-19 and U.S. Iran Policy, by Kenneth Katzman.
- CRS Legal Sidebar LSB10424, COVID-19: An Overview of Trade-Related Measures to Address Access to Medical Goods, by Nina M. Hart.
- CRS Report R46633, COVID-19 Vaccines: Global Health Issues, coordinated by Sara M. Tharakan.
- CRS Report R46304, COVID-19: China Medical Supply Chains and Broader Trade Issues, coordinated by Karen M. Sutter.
- CRS Insight IN11387, COVID-19: Defense Production Act (DPA) Developments and Issues for Congress, by Michael H. Cecire and Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS Insight IN11305, COVID-19: Defense Support of Civil Authorities, by Lawrence Kapp and Alan Ott.
- CRS In Focus IF11421, COVID-19: Global Implications and Responses, by Sara M. Tharakan et al.

-

⁸ Additional CRS reports that do not include COVID-19 in their titles and are not listed here may include discussions of the international implications of the COVID-19 pandemic.

- CRS Insight IN11280, COVID-19: Industrial Mobilization and Defense Production Act (DPA) Implementation, by Michael H. Cecire and Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS Insight IN11481, COVID-19 International Responses: Resources for Comparison with U.S. Policies, by Hannah Fischer and Sara M. Tharakan.
- CRS Insight IN11583, COVID-19 International Responses: Resources for the 117th Congress, by Hannah Fischer and Sara M. Tharakan.
- CRS Legal Sidebar LSB10436, COVID-19: International Trade and Access to Pharmaceutical Products, by Nina M. Hart.
- CRS In Focus IF11525, COVID-19: National Security and Defense Strategy, by Kathleen J. McInnis.
- CRS Video WVB00330, COVID-19 Public Health Series: Global Health and Development, by Sara M. Tharakan et al.
- CRS Insight IN11435, COVID-19-Related Suspension of Nonimmigrant Entry, by Jill H. Wilson.
- CRS Report R46342, COVID-19: Role of the International Financial Institutions, by Rebecca M. Nelson and Martin A. Weiss.
- CRS Insight IN11273, COVID-19: The Basics of Domestic Defense Response, coordinated by Michael J. Vassalotti.
- CRS In Focus IF11434, *COVID-19: U.S.-China Economic Considerations*, by Karen M. Sutter and Michael D. Sutherland.
- CRS Insight IN11470, Defense Production Act (DPA): Recent Developments in Response to COVID-19, by Michael H. Cecire and Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS In Focus IF11635, *Europe, COVID-19, and U.S. Relations*, by Kristin Archick et al.
- CRS In Focus IF11551, Export Restrictions in Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic, by Christopher A. Casey and Cathleen D. Cimino-Isaacs.
- CRS Legal Sidebar LSB10467, Foreign Sovereign Immunity and COVID-19 Lawsuits Against China, by Jennifer K. Elsea.
- CRS Insight IN11493, Global Economic Growth Forecasts: Impact of COVID-19, by James K. Jackson.
- CRS Report R46430, Global Democracy and Human Rights Impacts of COVID-19: In Brief, coordinated by Michael A. Weber.
- CRS In Focus IF11548, Helping U.S. Citizens Abroad During the COVID-19 Pandemic and Other International Crises: Role of the Department of State, by Cory R. Gill.
- CRS In Focus IF11796, *Global COVID-19 Vaccine Distribution*, coordinated by Sara M. Tharakan.
- CRS Report R46270, Global Economic Effects of COVID-19: Overview, by James K. Jackson.
- CRS Video WVB00380, *Impact of COVID-19 on Health Systems in Africa: A Dialogue with Experts*, by Tiaji Salaam-Blyther.
- CRS In Focus IF11537, *Intelligence Community Support to Pandemic Preparedness and Response*, by Michael E. DeVine.

- CRS Insight IN11732, *International COVID-19 Data and Vaccine Distribution: Selected Resources*, by Hannah Fischer.
- CRS In Focus IF11581, *Latin America and the Caribbean: Impact of COVID-19*, by Mark P. Sullivan et al.
- CRS Insight IN11535, *Mexican Drug Trafficking and Cartel Operations amid COVID-19*, by June S. Beittel and Liana W. Rosen.
- CRS Insight IN11619, New COVID-19 Defense Production Act (DPA) Actions: Implementation Considerations, by Michael H. Cecire, Nina M. Hart, and Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS Insight IN11593, New Presidential Directives on the Defense Production Act (DPA) and the COVID-19 Pandemic, by Michael H. Cecire and Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS Report R46319, Novel Coronavirus 2019 (COVID-19): Q&A on Global Implications and Responses, coordinated by Tiaji Salaam-Blyther.
- CRS In Focus IF11822, *Origins of the COVID-19 Pandemic*, coordinated by Tiaji Salaam-Blyther.
- CRS In Focus IF11480, Overview: The Department of Defense and COVID-19, coordinated by Kathleen J. McInnis.
- CRS In Focus IF11858, *Potential WTO TRIPS Waiver and COVID-19*, by Shayerah I. Akhtar and Ian F. Fergusson.
- CRS Insight IN11662, *Potential WTO TRIPS Waiver and COVID-19*, by Shayerah I. Akhtar and Ian F. Fergusson.
- CRS Insight IN11365, *President Trump Criticizes VOA Coverage of China's COVID-19 Response*, by Thomas Lum and Matthew C. Weed.
- CRS In Focus IF11880, Sovereign Debt and the COVID-19 Pandemic, by Martin A. Weiss.
- CRS Insight IN11231, The Defense Production Act (DPA) and COVID-19: Key Authorities and Policy Considerations, by Michael H. Cecire and Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS Insight IN11337, The Defense Production Act (DPA) and the COVID-19 Pandemic: Recent Developments and Policy Considerations, by Michael H. Cecire and Heidi M. Peters.
- CRS In Focus IF12013, *The U.S. Government's Role in Domestic and Global COVID-19 Vaccine Supply and Distribution: Frequently Asked Questions*, by Sara M. Tharakan and Taylor R. Wyatt.
- CRS In Focus IF11029, *The Venezuela Regional Humanitarian Crisis and COVID-19*, by Rhoda Margesson and Clare Ribando Seelke.
- CRS Insight IN11369, *U.S. Funding to the World Health Organization (WHO)*, by Luisa Blanchfield and Tiaji Salaam-Blyther.
- CRS Insight IN11325, *U.S. Travel and Tourism and COVID-19*, by Michaela D. Platzer.
- CRS In Focus IF11494, Wildlife Trade, COVID-19, and Other Zoonotic Diseases, by Pervaze A. Sheikh and Katarina C. O'Regan.

- CRS Report R47231, World Trade Organization: "TRIPS Waiver" for COVID-19 Vaccines, by Shayerah I. Akhtar.
- CRS In Focus IF11513, WTO: 12th Ministerial, COVID-19, and Ongoing Issues, by Cathleen D. Cimino-Isaacs and Rachel F. Fefer.

Appendix B. Additional Writings

In presenting sources of additional reading, this appendix includes some examples of writings reflecting various perspectives on the potential implications of the pandemic on the international security environment and the U.S. role in the world, organized by specific themes or topics. Within each section, the items are presented in chronological order, with the most recent on top. For most of the sections, additional citations with dates earlier than that of the last item listed in the section can be found in previous versions of this CRS report.

General/Multitopic

Grant Johnson, Sean M. Zeigler, Marco Hafner, and Catherine Galley, *Quantifying the Link between COVID-19, Conflict Risk, and the Global Economy*, RAND, 2023, 32 pp.

David A. Bell, "Does Putin's War Mark a New Period in History? It Has Been Only Two Years Since the Start of Another World Crisis Thought to Mark a New Era," *Foreign Policy*, July 1, 2022.

Michael Kugelman, "How COVID-19 Has Shaped South Asia, The Region Has Become a Pandemic Hot Spot," *Foreign Policy*, July 15, 2021.

Anthony Faiola, "Pandemic-Driven Hunger Is Making the World More Unequal," *Washington Post*, July 12, 2021.

Alex Ward, "The Pandemic's Impact on Our World Is Only Just Beginning, The US Intelligence Community Says the Coronavirus Will Impact You for Years to Come, Even If You Didn't Get Sick," *Vox*, April 14, 2021.

Dimitris Valatsas and Patrycja Koszykowska, "COVID-19's Baby Bust, Disasters Usually Come With Falling Birth Rates. But This Time, They Might Not Recover Unless Governments Take Action Now," *Foreign Policy*, April 9, 2021.

Julian E. Barnes, "U.S. Intelligence Report Warns of Global Consequences of Social Fragmentation, The Coronavirus Pandemic Has Highlighted Weaknesses of the International Order, Said the Report, Which Is Issued Every Four Years," *New York Times*, April 8, 2021.

Warren P. Strobel and Dustin Volz, "Covid-19 Fuels Inequality, Political Divide, Authoritarianism World-Wide, U.S. Intelligence Analysts Say, Quadrennial Global Trends Report Also Warns Privacy Will 'Effectively Disappear' and Synthetic Media Will 'Distort Truth and Reality," *Wall Street Journal*, April 8, 2021.

Laurie Goering, "African Leaders Warn COVID-19 Crisis Harming Climate Adaptation Push," *Reuters*, April 6, 2021.

Meghan Benton, Jeanne Batalova, Samuel Davidoff-Gore, and Timo Schmidt, *COVID-19 and the State of Global Mobility in 2020*, Migration Policy Institute, April 2021, 57 pp.

Michael Varnum, Cendri Hutcherson, and Igor Grossmann, "Everyone Was Wrong on the Pandemic's Societal Impact, In March 2020, a Study Asked Experts and Laypeople for Their Predictions. Neither Group Came Close to Being Right," *Foreign Policy*, March 18, 2021.

Bastian Giegerich, Fenella McGerty, and Peter Round, *The Geo-Economics and Geopolitics of COVID-19: Implications for European Security*, International Institute for Strategic Studies (IISS), March 2021, 23 pp. (Posted online March 16, 2021.)

Fabio Teixeira, "Over 20 Countries Found Weakening Environmental Protection During Pandemic," *Reuters*, March 11, 2021.

Edward Alden, "The Human Cost of Endless Pandemic Border Closures, One Year after the World Declared Borders Shut, There Is Still No Plan to Reduce the Toll on Millions of Lives," *Foreign Policy*, February 26, 2021.

Simon Lester Huan Zhu, "The Danger of Blindly Navigating Data Nationalism, Digital Trade and the Flow of Digital Information Are Certain to Grow in Prominence in the Future. The Coronavirus Pandemic Has Pushed Their Growth Curve Along," *National Interest*, February 21, 2021.

Judd Devermont, *A Post-Covid-19 Reset, The Future of Africa's Foreign Partnerships*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), February 2021, 14 pp.

John R. Allen et al., "The World After the Coronavirus, We Asked 12 Leading Thinkers to Predict What Happens in 2021 and Beyond," *Foreign Policy*, January 2, 2021.

IISS Manama Dialogue 2020 Special Publication: The Strategic and Geo-economic Implications of the COVID-19 Pandemic, International Institute for Strategic Studies (IISS), December 2020, 54 pp.

Colum Lynch, "U.N. Peacemaking in the Age of Plague, United Nations Diplomats and Civil Servants Fear Peace Efforts in Geneva May Aid the Spread of The Coronavirus," *Foreign Policy*, November 13, 2020.

Matthew Lavietes, "U.N. Says Pandemic Will Slow Already Miniscule Progress in Women's Rights," *Reuters*, October 20, 2020.

Travis Bubenik, "Costlier Than War: Researchers Put Pandemic's [U.S.] Price Tag at \$16 Trillion," *Courthouse News Service*, October 12, 2020.

Joseph S. Nye Jr., "COVID-19 Might Not Change the World, Pandemics Are Not Always Transformative Events. While Some Worrying Preexisting Trends Could Accelerate, It's Incorrect to Assume that the Coronavirus Will End Globalization, Kill Liberal Democracy, or Enhance China's Soft Power," *Foreign Policy*, October 9, 2020.

IGCC Experts, "Global Cooperation in the Time of COVID-19," Institute on Global Conflict and Cooperation, UC San Diego, October 5, 2020.

Vivek Wadhwa, "The Genetic Engineering Genie Is Out of the Bottle, the Next Pandemic Could be Bioengineered in Someone's Garage Using Cheap and Widely Available Technology," *Foreign Policy*, September 11, 2020.

Sohini Chatterjee and Mark P. Lagon, "The Cataclysmic Great Power Challenge Everyone Saw Coming, Violent Extremism, Migration, Pandemics, and Climate Change Are Among the Burgeoning List of Fundamental Challenges That Will Require Transnational Cooperation and Collaboration," *National Interest*, August 28, 2020.

Edward Alden, "The World Needs to Reopen Borders Before It's Too Late, Even As They Struggle to Control the Pandemic, Governments Should Move Quickly to Reopen Borders Instead of Giving in to Xenophobia, Nationalism, and Illusions of Autarky," *Foreign Policy*, August 25, 2020.

Daniel W. Drezner, "The Song Remains the Same: International Relations After COVID-19," Cambridge University Press, August 19, 2020.

Michael R. Kenwick and Beth A. Simmons, "Pandemic Response as Border Politics," Cambridge University Press, August 19, 2020.

Mohan Malik, "The Pandemic's Geopolitical Aftershocks," *Strategist (Australian Strategic Policy Institute)*, August 4, 2020.

Seth A. Johnston, "The Pandemic and the Limits of Realism, The Foundational International Relations Theory Has Been Revealed to Be Far Less Realistic Than It Claims," *Foreign Policy*, June 24, 2020.

James Goldgeier and Carmen Iezzi Mezzera, "How to Rethink the Teaching of International Relations, As Universities Struggle to Respond to the Ongoing Pandemic, Here's What They Should Focus On," *Foreign Policy*, June 12, 2020.

Stephen M. Walt, "The Pandemic's 5 Silver Linings, The Coronavirus Has Exacted a Terrible Toll—But Some Good Things May Come of It Yet," *Foreign Policy*, May 26, 2020.

Tom McTague, "The Pandemic's Geopolitical Aftershocks Are Coming, Western Capitals Aren't Just Worried About the Risk of a Resurgence in Coronavirus Cases," *Atlantic*, May 18, 2020.

Stephen M. Walt, "Will a Global Depression Trigger Another World War? The Coronavirus Pandemic Has Already Devastated the International Economy. Its Military Fallout Remains to Be Seen," *Foreign Policy*, May 13, 2020.

Phillip Y. Lipscy, "It's Too Soon to Call Coronavirus Winners and Losers, Given how much remains unknown about the virus, talk of success may be premature," *Foreign Policy*, May 12, 2020.

Alan Nicol, "The Pandemic Is Laying Bare a Global Water Crisis, Insufficient Water for Washing Is Likely to Worsen the Coronavirus in the Poorest Nations. There's a Better Way Forward," *Foreign Policy*, May 12, 2020.

George H. Nash, "The Coronavirus Pandemic of 2020 in Historical Perspective," *National Review*, May 11, 2020.

Edith M. Lederer, "UN Chief Says Pandemic Is Unleashing a 'Tsunami of Hate," *Associated Press*, May 8, 2020.

Nikolas K. Gvosdev, "Why the Coronavirus Won't Transform International Affairs Like 9/11 Did," *National Interest*, May 5, 2020.

Deepanshu Mohan, "The Geopolitical Contours of a Post-COVID-19 World," *East Asia Forum*, May 2, 2020.

Andrew Ehrhardt, "Disease and Diplomacy in the 19th Century," War on the Rocks, April 30, 2019.

Resilience in the Face of the Coronavirus Pandemic, World Politics Review report, May 2020, 47 pp. (Includes essays by various authors with the titles "Planning for the World After the Coronavirus Pandemic," "What It Will Take to Save Economies From the Coronavirus Pandemic," "Building Trust, Confidence and Collective Action in the Age of COVID-19," "Why Tackling Corruption Is Crucial to the Global Coronavirus Response," and "The Geography of COVID-19 and a Vulnerable Global Food System.")

Iain King, "How Covid-19 Will Change Us: Seven Lessons from the Most Consequential Pandemics in History," Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), April 29, 2020.

Dmitri K. Simes, "The Perfect Storm," National Interest, April 24, 2020.

Fred Kaplan, "What Happens if Oil Doesn't Recover? If Demand Doesn't Pick Up This Summer, We Could See Major Shifts in Global Power," *Slate*, April 23, 2020.

Barry R. Posen, "Do Pandemics Promote Peace? Why Sickness Slows the March to War," *Foreign Affairs*, April 23, 2020.

Joseph Cirincione, "How to Prevent War During the Coronavirus Pandemic, How Will the Coronavirus Threaten Global Peace?" *National Interest*, April 22, 2020.

Frank Hoffman, "An American Perspective on Post-Pandemic Geopolitics," RUSI, April 20, 2020.

Gordon Bardos, "Will the Coronavirus Crisis Force America to Look in the Mirror and Reform?" *National Interest*, April 18, 2020.

Nicholas Eberstadt, "The "New Normal": Thoughts about the Shape of Things to Come in the Post-Pandemic World," National Bureau of Asian Research, April 18, 2020.

Steve Coll, "Woodrow Wilson's Case of the Flu, and How Pandemics Change History," *New Yorker*, April 17, 2020.

Ravi Kant, "Coronavirus: An Ice-Nine Moment for the World," Asia Times, April 15, 2020.

Jackson Diehl, "The Pandemic Is Killing Truth, Too," Washington Post, April 12, 2020.

Edith M. Lederer, "UN Chief Warns COVID-19 Threatens Global Peace and Security," *Associated Press*, April 10, 2020.

Richard Haass, "The Pandemic Will Accelerate History Rather Than Reshape It, Not Every Crisis Is a Turning Point, *Foreign Affairs*, April 7, 2020.

Stratfor Worldview, "How the Coronavirus Pandemic Is Changing the World—and the Future," *National Interest*, April 4, 2020.

Daniel W. Drezner, "The Most Counterintuitive Prediction about World Politics and the Coronavirus, What If Nothing Changes?" *Washington Post*, March 30, 2020.

Ali Demirdas, "Western Values May Not Survive the Coronavirus. European Unity and American Military Power Just Haven't Held Up," *National Interest*, March 28, 2020.

John Allen et al., "How the World Will Look after the Coronavirus Pandemic," *Foreign Policy*, March 20, 2020. (Includes short contributions from 12 authors.)

Maxine Whittaker, "How Infectious Diseases Have Shaped Our Culture, Habits and Language," *The Conversation*, July 12, 2017.

World Order, International Institutions, and Global Governance

Erin Banco, Ashleigh Furlong, and Lennart Pfahler, "How Bill Gates and Partners Used Their Clout To Control The Global Covid Response—With Little Oversight; Four Health Organizations, Working Closely Together, Spent Almost \$10 Billion On Responding to Covid Across the World. But They Lacked the Scrutiny of Governments, and Fell Short of Their Own Goals, a POLITICO and WELT Investigation Found," *Politico*, September 14, 2022.

Angela Kane and Jaime Yassif, "A Better Way to Detect the Origins of a Pandemic," *Arms Control Today (Arms Control Association)*, July/August 2022.

Andrew Ehrhardt, "International Order Through the Historian's Eye," *War on the Rocks*, November 22, 2021. (Book review of Colin Kahl and Thomas Wright, *Aftershocks: Pandemic Politics and the End of the Old International Order*, St. Martin's Press; 464 pp.)

Economist, "Two New Books Assess the Geopolitical Lessons of Covid-19, They Are Bleak, Say 'Aftershocks' and 'Geopolitics for the End Time," *Economist*, October 9, 2021. (Book review of Colin Kahl and Thomas Wright, *Aftershocks: Pandemic Politics and the End of the Old International Order*, St. Martin's Press; 464 pp., and Bruno Maçães, *Geopolitics for the End Time*, Hurst; 240 pp.)

Rosemary Flowers-Wanjie, "Rich Countries Are Ignoring the Global Vaccine System, Money Isn't the Problem. Power Is," *Foreign Policy*, September 23, 2021.

Jeneen Interlandi, "The World Is at War With Covid. Covid Is Winning," *New York Times*, September 21, 2021.

Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala, Tharman Shanmugaratnam, and Lawrence H. Summers, "We Don't Have to Fly Blind into the Next Pandemic," *Washington Post*, September 16, 2021.

Adam Tooze, "What if the Coronavirus Crisis Is Just a Trial Run?" New York Times, September 1, 2021.

Catherine Osborn, "COVAX Is Not Working, Will the Pandemic's Delta Phase be More Equitable?" *Foreign Policy*, August 6, 2021.

Simon Frankel Pratt and Jamie Levin, "Vaccines Will Shape the New Geopolitical Order, The Gulf Between Haves and Have-Nots is Only Growing," *Foreign Policy*, April 29, 2021.

Nina Schwalbe, "The World Should Treat Pandemics Like It Treats Chemical Weapons, Plans for a Global Pandemic Treaty Don't Solve the Problem of China's Refusal to Cooperate," *Foreign Policy*, April 14, 2021.

Scott Neuman, "Many World Leaders Call For Treaty On Future Pandemics," NPR, March 30, 2021.

Helen V. Milner, Susan Peterson, Ryan Powers, Michael J. Tierney, and Erik Voeten, "Trump, COVID-19, and the Future of International Order, In a New Survey, International Relations Experts Are Pessimistic About the Years to Come," *Foreign Policy*, October 8, 2020.

Seth Center and Emma Bates, editors, *After Disruption: Historical Perspectives on the Future of International Order*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), September 2020, 65 pp.

Hung Tran, "One World, Two Systems" Takes Shape During the Pandemic, Atlantic Council, September 2020, 10 pp.

Brett D. Schaefer and Danielle Pletka, "How the WHO Can Earn Back U.S. Support," Heritage Foundation, August 17, 2020.

Bobo Lo, "Global Order in the Shadow of the Coronavirus: China, Russia and the West, It's Time to Rethink Global Governance and its Priorities," Lowy Institute, July 29, 2020.

Robert D. Blackwill Thomas Wright, "Why COVID-19 Presents a World Reordering Moment," *National Interest*, July 11, 2020.

Jeffrey Cimmino et al., A Global Strategy for Shaping the Post-COVID-19 World, Atlantic Council, 2020 (released July 7, 2020), 52 pp.

Mary Robinson, "Multilateralism Offers Hope for a Sea-Change after COVID-19," *The Hill*, June 26, 2020.

Aparna Pande, "India Could Emerge as the Global Power the World Has Been Waiting for After COVID," *Hudson Institute*, June 8, 2020.

James Crabtree, "Welcome to a World of Bubbles, Countries Across Europe and Asia Are Exploring Special Bilateral Arrangements to Ease Border Restrictions. The Result Could Be a Globe Fractured Along Epidemiological Lines," *Foreign Policy*, June 1, 2020.

Jeffrey Cimmino, Matthew Kroenig, and Barry Pavel, *Taking Stock: Where Are Geopolitics Headed in the COVID-19 Era?* Atlantic Council, June 2020, 20 pp.

U.S. Global Leadership and Role in World

Julian E. Barnes, "Report Chronicles U.S. Intelligence Shortcomings as Pandemic Emerged, The Report by Democrats on the House Intelligence Committee Raises Questions about How Well Prepared Spy Agencies Are for Future Global Health Crises," *New York Times*, December 15, 2022.

Emily Bass, "The U.S. Congress Is Missing the Boat on Global Health Reform," *Foreign Policy*, April 4, 2022.

Michael Gerson, "We Need a Global Response to Covid as Urgent as That Against Russian Aggression," *Washington Post*, March 7, 2022.

Dan Diamond and Emily Rauhala, "U.S. Will 'Surge' Vaccine Support to 11 African Countries," *Washington Post*, February 17, 2022.

Francesco Guarascio and Emma Farge, "Exclusive: U.S. Funding to WHO Fell by 25% During Pandemic," *Reuters*, January 25, 2022.

Krishna B. Kumar, "America Can Still Deliver on Global Vaccine Diplomacy," *National Interest*, December 28, 2021.

Eric Banco, "It's a Sore Spot for a Lot of People': Why Officials Are Raising Questions About Biden's Vaccine Donations," *Politico*, December 8, 2021.

Carmen Paun, "Blinken Announces New Efforts to Speed Global Vaccination," *Politico Pro*, November 10, 2021.

Vidya Krishnan, "How to End Vaccine Apartheid, The United States Has Failed on Its Boast to Be an 'Arsenal Of Vaccines," *Foreign Policy*, November 9, 2021.

Andrea Shalal, "U.S., Indonesia Call for New G20 Forum to Prepare for Next Pandemic," *Reuters*, October 26, 2021.

David Brunnstrom, "U.S. Says Delivering on Vaccine Pledge to Asia Key to Quad Credibility," *Reuters*, October 20, 2021.

Jonah Blank, "Biden Can Bounce Back From Afghanistan—By Vaccinating the World, My Former Boss Has a Rare Opportunity to Prove His Critics Wrong," *Foreign Policy*, September 10, 2021.

Katherine Eban, "How 'Micromanagement and Distrust' Hobbled Biden's Global Vaccination Push, The White House Says It Is Donating More Doses Than 'All Other Countries Combined,' But Critics Inside and Outside the U.S. Government Warn of an Effort that Is 'Wildly Insufficient,'" *Vanity Fair*, September 9, 2021.

Isaac Chotiner, "Has the Biden Administration Failed on Global Vaccines? Krishna Udayakumar, The Founding Director of Duke's Global Health Innovation Center, Describes What the U.S. Needs to Do Now to Support Vaccination Around the World," *New Yorker*, August 31, 2021.

Eric A. Friedman and Lawrence O. Gostin, "The Whole World Needs Vaccines Before a Worse Variant Than Delta Arrives, The United States Has to Put Global Health First Unless It Wants a New Disaster," *Foreign Policy*, August 24, 2021.

Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), *US Emergency Plan for Global COVID-19 Relief: Urgent Action to End the Pandemic Globally and Accelerate US Recovery and Security*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), August 3, 2021, 9 pp.

Oluwatosin Adeshokan et al., "Africa Reacts to U.S. Vaccine Distribution at Home and Abroad," Cener for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), July 29, 2021.

CSIS Commission on Strengthening America's Health Security, *Time to Escalate U.S. Leadership on Covid-19 and Beyond*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), July 2021, 16 pp. (Posted online July 21, 2021.) (The report states on its final page that its authors are Julie Gerberding, Susan Brooks, J. Stephen Morrison, Anna McCaffrey, and Katherine E. Bliss.)

Robbie Gramer, "Biden to Ship Millions of Vaccines to Africa, The United States Will Donate 25 Million Doses as African Countries Reel from a Third Wave of COVID-19," *Foreign Policy*, July 16, 2021.

Michael Gerson, "Covid-19's Global Spread is a Test for America," *Washington Post*, July 15, 2021.

Robert Zoellick, "Liberal Democracies Are Running Out of Time to Save the rest of the Planet from Covid," *Washington Post*, July 9, 2021.

Derek Thompson, "World War II's Lesson for After the Pandemic, The U.S. Needs Another Innovation Dream Team," *Atlantic*, June 28, 2021.

David Adesnik, "America's Syrian Allies Deserve the COVID-19 Vaccine, They Vanquished the Islamic State and Are Now in Desperate Need of Aid," *Foreign Policy*, June 22, 2021.

Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, "Biden Boosts Vaccine-Sharing, Says U.S. Soon Will Outpace Donations By Russia, China," Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, May 18, 2021.

Christian Paz, "America's Vaccine Nationalism Isn't Working, The Longer It Takes for the United States to Lead a Global Response, the More the Risks Compound," *Atlantic*, May 13, 2021.

Karen De Young, "Samantha Power Wants to Restore U.S. Prestige by Getting American-made Vaccines 'Into Arms' Around the World," *Washington Post*, May 11 (updated May 12), 2021.

Dan Diamond and Tyler Pager, "Where is the plan?": Biden Pressed on Global Vaccine Strategy, Critics Say the Administration Has Taken a Piecemeal Approach to the Worsening International Crisis," *Washington Post*, May 9, 2021.

Chelsea Clinton and Achal Prabhala, "Biden Has the Power to Vaccinate the World, He Should Use It," *Atlantic*, May 5, 2021.

Tom Frieden and Marine Buissonnière, "The U.S. Has the Power to Tamp Down Coronavirus Variants—If We're Willing to Use It," *Politico*, March 2, 2021.

Gregory B. Poling, "Embracing a Pandemic-Centered Foreign Policy," Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), March 1, 2021.

Dan Diamond and Jeff Stein, "White House Is Split Over How to Vaccinate the World," *Washington Post*, April 30, 2021.

Michael Hirsh, "Health Experts Slam Biden's 'Massive' Global Leadership Failure, Biden's Speech to Congress Ignores His Dithering on COVID-19 Vaccine Patents, Jeopardizing Millions of Lives in Other Nations, Critics Say.," *Foreign Policy*, April 29, 2021.

J. Stephen Morrison, Katherine E. Bliss, and Anna McCaffrey, *The Time Is Now for U.S. Global Leadership on Covid-19 Vaccines*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), April 2021, 11 pp. (Posted online April 14, 2021.)

Anne Applebaum, "What America's Vaccination Campaign Proves to the World, The U.S. Stumbled Early in the Pandemic, But the Vaccine Rollout Could Reboot the Country's Image," *Atlantic*, April 10, 2021.

Azmi Haroun, "Global NGOs Call on the Biden Administration to Concoct a Plan for Sharing Vaccine Surplus with Nations in Need," *Business Insider*, March 30, 2021.

Justin Talbot Zorn and Mathias Alencastro, "In Brazil, Vaccine Diplomacy Can Help Save the Climate, Washington Should Bypass Bolsonaro and Open a Direct Dialogue on Amazon Deforestation with Local Leaders in Regions Hit Hard by COVID-19," *Foreign Policy*, March 30, 2021.

John Oldfield, "We Need US Leadership on Water Security to Combat COVID-19 Globally," *The Hill*, March 29, 2021.

Thomas J. Bollyky, "Democracies Keep Vaccines for Themselves, President Biden's Pledge to Mexico Is an Exception from a Stark Pattern.," *Atlantic*, March 27, 2021.

Dave Lawler, "Biden's Next Challenge: Vaccine Diplomacy," Axios, March 22, 2021.

Selam Gebrekidan and Matt Apuzzo, "Rich Countries Signed Away a Chance to Vaccinate the World, Despite Warnings, American and European Officials Gave Up Leverage that Could Have Guaranteed Access for Billions of People. That Risks Prolonging the Pandemic," *New York Times*, March 21 (updated May 7), 2021.

Jason Marczak and Cristina Guevara, COVID-19 Recovery in Latin America and the Caribbean: A Partnership Strategy for the Biden Administration, Atlantic Council, March 2021, 37 pp. (Posted online March 16, 2021.)

Colm Quinn, "G-7 Scrambles for Global Vaccine Plan, After Months of Warnings, the Group of Wealthy Nations Has Begun to Put Forward Solutions to the Lopsided Distribution of Coronavirus Vaccines," *Foreign Policy*, February 19, 2021.

Emily Rauhala, Erin Cunningham, and Adam Taylor, "White House Announces \$4 Billion in Funding for Covax, the Global Vaccine Effort that Trump Spurned," *Washington Post*, February 18, 2021.

Jan Tore Sanner, "Why the Rich World Cannot Afford to Leave the Poor Behind on Vaccines," *Government.no (Government of Norway)*, February 16, 2021.

Alex Leary, "Biden to Join G-7 Leaders in Virtual Meeting to Discuss Pandemic Response," *Wall Street Journal*, February 14, 2021.

Ethan Guillén, "End the Pandemic Faster by Listening to Developing Countries, Biden Has a Golden Opportunity to Help with Global Vaccines," *Foreign Policy*, February 8, 2021.

Jonathan Tepperman, "The Global Vaccine Rollout Is Failing—and That Puts Everyone, Everywhere, In Danger, The Selfish Reasons the United States and Europe Must Help Poor Countries Deal with COVID-19," *Foreign Policy*, January 28, 2021.

White House, "National Security Directive on United States Global Leadership to Strengthen the International COVID-19 Response and to Advance Global Health Security and Biological Preparedness," National Security Directive 1, White House, January 21, 2021.

Kenneth C. Brill, "COVID-19 Vaccine Lessons for American Diplomacy after Trump," *The Hill*, January 14, 2021.

China's Potential Role as a Global Leader

Kanis Leung and Huizhong Wu, "Chinese Who Reported on COVID to Be Released After 3 Years," *Associated Press*, April 30, 2023.

Aaron Sarin, "China's Missing Million, The CCP's Chronic Opacity Means We Will Never Know the Country's True Covid Death Toll," *Persuasion*, April 28, 2023.

F. D. Flam, "China Owes Us All the Truth About When Covid Emerged," *Bloomberg*, April 29, 2023.

Mara Hvistendahl and Benjamin Mueller, "Chinese Censorship Is Quietly Rewriting the Covid-19 Story, Under Government Pressure, Chinese Scientists Have Retracted Studies and Withheld or Deleted Data. The Censorship Has Stymied Efforts to Understand the Virus," *New York Times*, April 23, 2023.

Dake Kang, "Ignoring Experts, China's Sudden Zero-COVID Exit Cost Lives," *Associated Press*, March 24, 2023.

Michael Schuman, "Can a Million Chinese People Die and Nobody Know? Official Statistics on COVID Can't Be Trusted, Because They Serve Beijing's Political Interests. Making the Dead Disappear Is Only Part of It," *Atlantic*, February 24, 2023.

Yanzhong Huang, "China's Hidden COVID Catastrophe, How Xi Obscured a Lethal Viral Wave—and What It Means for the Future of His Regime," *Foreign Affairs*, February 16, 2023.

James Glanz, Mara Hvistendahl, and Agnes Chang, "How Deadly Was China's Covid Wave? Two Months After China Ended "Zero Covid," Rough Estimates Suggest that Between 1 and 1.5 Million People Died — Far More than the Official Count," *New York Times*, February 15, 2023.

Peter Martin and Jenny Leonard, "The US Keeps Offering China Its Covid Vaccines. China Keeps Saying No," *Bloomberg*, January 6, 2023.

Andy Bounds, "EU Offers Free Covid-19 Vaccines to China to Help Curb Outbreak, Beijing Rejects Brussels' Offer, Citing Full Control of Situation," *Financial Times*, January 3, 2023.

Isabel Hilton, "Xi Jinping's Reputation in China and His Standing in the World May Not Survive This Covid Disaster," *Guardian*, January 1, 2023.

James Palmer, Michael Rowand, and Tracy Wen Liu, "How China Botched the End of Zero-COVID, Other Countries Have Successfully Transitioned from Strict Lockdowns. Beijing Has Wasted the Last Three Years," *Foreign Policy*, December 22, 2022.

Chris Buckley, Alexandra Stevenson, and Keith Bradsher, "From Zero Covid to No Plan: Behind China's Pandemic U-Turn, After Micromanaging the Coronavirus Strategy for Nearly Three

Years, the Country's Leader, Xi Jinping, Has Suddenly Left the Populace to Improvise," *New York Times*, December 19 (updated December 21), 2022.

Editorial Board, "China's Botched Covid Reopening, Rushed Exit from Hardline Policy Shatters Myth of Beijing's Competence," *Financial Times*, December 19, 2022.

Tara D. Sonenshine, "The Coming China Rebrand," *The Hill*, December 5, 2022.

Yanzhong Huang, "China's Struggle With Covid Is Just Beginning," *New York Times*, December 4, 2022.

Vivan Wang, "The Chinese Dream, Denied, The World's Harshest Covid Restrictions Exemplify How Xi Jinping's Authoritarian Excesses Have Rewritten Beijing's Longstanding Social Contract with Its People," *New York Times*, December 4, 2022.

Coco Liu, "China's Covid Zero Policy Is Putting Its Climate Action on Ice," *Bloomberg*, November 29, 2022.

Editorial Board, "Zero Covid' Has Pummeled China into a Crisis. Xi Should React," *Washington Post*, November 28, 2022.

Gideon Rachman, "Xi Jinping's Pandemic Triumphalism Returns to Haunt Him, The President's Hubris and Authoritarianism Have Trapped China in Endless Lockdowns," *Financial Times*, November 28, 2022.

Jamie Smyth and Eleanor Olcott, "Beijing's Failure to Import mRNA Covid Jabs 'Mind-Boggling', Says BeiGene Executive, Chinese Biotech's Research Chief Calls Decision 'Unfortunate' as Zero-Covid Policy Strangles Economy," *Financial Times*, October 13, 2022.

Editorial Board, "How Did the Pandemic Begin? China Must Help Find the Answer," *Washington Post*, June 9, 2022.

John R. Deni, et al., China, Europe, and the Pandemic Recession: Beijing's Investments and Transatlantic Security, Strategic Studies Institute (SSI), U.S. Army War College, May 2022, 266 pp.

Christian Shepherd, "Covid Pushed China Away from the World Stage. But Its Global Ambitions Persist," *Washington Post*, November 19, 2021.

Gideon Rachman, "China's Self-Isolation Is a Global Concern, Beijing's Zero-Covid Policy Is Damaging International Business and Global Governance," *Financial Times*, November 8, 2021.

James T. Areddy, "China Aims to Export 2 Billion Covid-19 Vaccines This Year, Commitment Expands Chinese Diplomatic Effort to Help Developing Nations, as Delta Variant Spreads," *Wall Street Journal*, August 6, 2021.

Sui-Lee Wee, "They Relied on Chinese Vaccines. Now They're Battling Outbreaks. More Than 90 Countries Are Using Covid Shots from China. Experts Say Recent Infections in Those Places Should Serve As a Cautionary Tale in the Global Effort to Fight the Disease," *New York Times*, June 22 (updated June 28), 2021.

Raymond Zhong and Christopher F. Schuetze, "Taiwan Wants German Vaccines. China May Be Standing in Its Way," *New York Times*, June 16 (updated June 22), 2021.

Associated Press, "Taiwan Says China Exploiting Vaccines for Political Gain," *Associated Press*, June 3, 2021.

Adam Taylor and Paul Schemm, "China's Great Vaccine Hope, Sinopharm, Sees Reputation Darkened Amid Covid Spikes in Countries Using It," *Washington Post*, June 3, 2021.

Uwagbale Edward-Ekpu, "China's Vaccine Outreach in Africa is Falling Short of Beijing's Pledges," *Quartz Africa*, May 21, 2021.

Ben Smith, "When Covid Hit, China Was Ready to Tell Its Version of the Story, The Government Has Been Using Its Money and Power to Create an Alternative to a Global News Media Dominated by Outlets like the BBC and CNN," *New York Times*, May 9 (updated May 29), 2021.

Vincent Ni, "Border Dispute Casts Shadow over China's Offers of Covid Help for India," *Guardian*, April 29, 2021.

Isabel Bernhard, "Latin America Believed in Chinese Vaccines. Now It May Have Reason to Rethink, China's Latest Disclosure Could Reconfigure Regional Politics and Promote Domestic Development Across the Americas," *Diplomat*, April 21, 2021.

Kareem Fahim and Karen DeYoung, "China Has Made Big Vaccine Promises. When They Come Up Short, Nations Struggle," *Washington Post*, April 7, 2021.

James Palmer, "China's Vaccine Diplomacy Has Mixed Results, Concerns About the Efficacy of Sinovac and Sinopharm Has Dented Their Reputation, Even Among Allies of Beijing," *Foreign Policy*, April 7, 2021.

Francisco Urdinez, *China's Improvised Mask Diplomacy in Chile*, Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, April 2021, 30 pp. (Posted online April 6, 2021.)

Richard Javad Heydarian, "China's Vaccine Diplomacy Stumbles in Southeast Asia, Delays and Concerns About the Efficacy and Politics of China's Vaccine Shipments Plague Its Vaccine Drive in the Region," *Al Jazeera*, April 5, 2021.

Eli Lake, "China's Claims of Exoneration on Covid Ring Hollow, Even the Head of the World Health Organization Found Its Report on the Pandemic's Origins Insufficient," *Bloomberg*, April, 2, 2021.

Emily Rauhala, "WHO Chief, U.S. and Other World Leaders Criticize China for Limiting Access of Team Researching Coronavirus Origins," *Washington Post*, March 30, 2021.

Rajni George, "At China's Borders, "Vaccine Passports" Just Got Real, In Announcing It Would Prioritize Travelers Who Had Received Chinese-Made Vaccines, Beijing Sparked Outrage in Countries Where Those Aren't Available," *Foreign Policy*, March 25, 2021.

Elliot Hannon, "China's Happy to Share Its COVID-19 Vaccines, but Not the Data Showing if They Actually Work," *Slate*, March 24, 2021.

Eva Dou and Shibani Mahtani, "China's Vaccine Diplomacy Stumbles as Clinical Trial Data Remains Absent," *Washington Post*, March 23, 2021.

Bret Schafer, Amber Frankland, Nathan Kohlenberg, and Etienne Soula, "Influence-enza: How Russia, China, and Iran Have Shaped and Manipulated Coronavirus Vaccine Narratives," Alliance for Securing Democracy (German Marshall Fud of the United States), March 6, 2021.

Huizhong Wu and Kristen Gelineau, "Chinese Vaccines Sweep Much of the World, Despite Concerns," *Associated Press*, March 2, 2021.

Laura Pitel, "Turkey's Uighurs Fear Betrayal over Chinese Vaccines and Trade, Erdogan Accused of Toning down Rhetoric about Oppressed Muslims to Avoid Upsetting Beijing," *Financial Times*, February 24, 2021.

Mordechai Chaziza, "Chinese Health Diplomacy and the Maghreb in the COVID-19 Era," *Middle East Institute*, February 23, 2021.

Yang Lizhong and Chen Dingding, "Is China's COVID-19 Diplomacy Working in Southeast Asia? A Recent Poll Suggests a Mixed Picture for China," *Diplomat*, February 20, 2021.

Jason Hung, "In China's 'Vaccine Diplomacy' with the Philippines, Both Sides Are Taking Big Risks," East-West Center, February 19, 2021.

Lucien O. Chauvin, Anthony Faiola, and Eva Dou, "Squeezed Out of the Race for Western Vaccines, Developing Countries Turn to China," *Washington Post*, February 16, 2021.

Erika Kinetz, "Anatomy of a Conspiracy: With COVID, China Took leading Role," *Associated Press*, February 15, 2021.

Alex Leary, "U.S. Expresses 'Deep Concerns' Over China Withholding Data From Pandemic Investigators," *Wall Street Journal*, February 13, 2021.

Javier C. Hernández and James Gorman, "On W.H.O. Trip, China Refused to Hand Over Important Data," *New York Times*, February 12, 2021.

U.S. Relations and Great Power Competition with China and Russia

Bob Davis, "China's COVID-19 Failure Isn't a Win for Democracy, The Pandemic Years Strained Every System of Government," *Foreign Policy*, January 8, 2023.

Humeyra Pamuk, "U.S. State Dept Says Toll of COVID in China a Concern for the World," *Associated Press*, December 19, 2022.

Megan K. Stack, "A Contagion the U.S. and China Both Fear: Each Other," *New York Times*, December 10, 2022.

Caitlin Doornbos, "China Used COVID-19 to Win Global Favor with Propaganda, Aid: Pentagon," *New York Post*, November 30, 2022.

Paul Krugman, "How China Lost the Covid War," New York Times, November 28, 2022.

Jason Douglas and Raffaele Huang, "China's Central Bank Takes Action as Record Covid-19 Outbreak Hits Economy, People's Bank of China Frees Up Billions of Yuan for New Loans, But Economists Are Skeptical It Will Lift Growth," *Wall Street Journal*, November 25, 2022.

Jason Douglas, "China Recovery Set Back by Record Covid Outbreak as Lockdowns Spread, Economists See Pandemic Restrictions as a Brake on Growth in the World's Second-Largest Economy," *Wall Street Journal*, November 24, 2022.

Ville Sinkkonen and Anu Ruokamo, *Vaccines As Contentious Connectivity in the Indo-Pacific: The Case of US-China Competition During the Covid-19 Pandemic*, Finnish Institute of International Affairs (FIIA), October 2022, 25 pp.

Andrei Iancu and David J. Kappos, "Team Biden Ready to Hand Russia and China Vaccine Technology—Free of Charge," *New York Post*, June 5, 2022.

Edward Lucas *et al.*, "Post-Mortem: Russian and Chinese COVID-19 Information Operations," Center for European Policy Analysis (CEPA), May 26, 2022.

Huizhong Wu and Aniruddha Ghosal, "China's Bet on Homegrown mRNA Vaccines Holds Back Nation," *Associated Press*, May 24, 2022.

Shin Watanabe and Kentaro Takeda, "China's Vaccine Diplomacy Spoiled by Omicron Variant, Sinopharm, Sinovac and Cansino Biologics Exports Fall 97% on Poor Protection," *Nikkei Asia*, May 8, 2022.

Matthew T. Page and Paul Stronski, "How Russia's Hollow Humanitarianism Hurt Its Vaccine Diplomacy in Africa," Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, April 28, 2022.

Kirsty Needham, "Australia's Vaccine Diplomacy in Pacific Islands Wards Off Beijing, Prime Minister Says," *Reuters*, March 12, 2022.

María Eugenia Brizuela de Ávila, Riyad Insanally, Claudia Trevisan, and Bosco Marti, *US-China Vaccine Diplomacy: Lessons from Latin America and the Caribbean*, Atlantic Council, February 2022, 12 pp. (Posted online February 23, 2022.)

Riyani Sidek and Nafisa Halim, "China's Vaccine Diplomacy in Brunei: Boon or Bane?" *Diplomat*, January 28, 2022.

Erin Banco, "Trump Plan Favored Giving Vaccines to Israel, Taiwan over Poorer Countries," *Politico*, January 27, 2022.

Amit Gupta, "COVID-19 and Superpower Competition: An Effective American Response," *Prism (National Defense University Press)*, January 20, 2022.

Adam Taylor, "Beijing and Moscow Are Losing the Vaccine Diplomacy Battle," *Washington Post*, January 11, 2022.

Anna Nishino, "Pharmacy of the World: China's Quest to be the No. 1 Drugmaker," *Nekkei Asia*, December 23, 2021.

Paul Stronski, "Russian COVID-19 Diplomacy in Africa: A Mixed Bag," Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, December 10, 2021.

Matthew Renda, "Covid-Related Social Media Disinformation Campaign by China Fell Flat," *Courthouse News Service*, December 1, 2021.

"China, Russia Used Pandemic Disinformation to Undermine U.S., Report Says," *Washington Times*, November 15, 2021.

Christian Johnson and William Marcellino, *Bad Actors in News Reporting, Tracking News Manipulation by State Actors*, RAND, 2021, 19 pp.

Chao Deng and Joe Parkinson, "China's Army Furnishes Foreign Militaries With Covid-19 Vaccines, The People's Liberation Army Has Helped Further Beijing's Global Interests During the Pandemic, Bringing Doses Directly to Militaries," *Wall Street Journal*, November 8, 2021.

China Power Team, "Is China Succeeding at Shaping Global Narratives about Covid-19?" China Power (Center for Strategic and International Studies [CSIS]). October 22 (updated November 8), 2021.

Anna Nishino, "Production, Politics and Propaganda, How Beijing Has Shaped the International COVID Immunization Drive," *Nikkei Asia*, October 12, 2021.

Bonny Lin, Matthew P. Funaiole, Brian Hart, and Hannah Price, "China Is Exploiting the Pandemic to Advance Its Interests, with Mixed Results," Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), September 30, 2021.

China Power Team. "Is China's Covid-19 Diplomacy Succeeding?" China Power (Center for Strategic and International Studies [CSIS]), September 23 (updated September 30), 2021.

Bob Herman, "The U.S. Isn't Vaccinating Most of the World—But China Might," *Axios*, September 13, 2021.

Asif Muztaba Hassan, "China Swoops Into Bangladesh With a Vaccine Deal, It Bided Its Time and When India Halted Supply of Vaccines to Bangladesh, It Saw Opportunity and Struck," *Diplomat*, August 24, 2021.

Sui-Lee Wee and Steven Lee Myers, "As Chinese Vaccines Stumble, U.S. Finds New Opening in Asia, Several Southeast Asian Nations Are Raising Doubts about the Efficacy of China's Vaccines. The Biden Administration Has Recently Offered to Provide Shots, 'No Strings Attached,'" *New York Times*, August 20 (updated September 30), 2021.

James Palmer, "Why China Keeps Spinning COVID-19 Conspiracies, A Fake Expert Is the Latest Part of a State Media Push to Blame the United States for the Pandemic—at Great Diplomatic Cost," *Foreign Policy*, August 11, 2021.

Shibani Mahtani, "Ravaged by Delta Outbreak, Southeast Asia Shifts Away from China's Vaccines," *Washington Post*, August 10, 2021.

Bloomberg News, "China's Covid-Zero Strategy Risks Leaving It Isolated for Years," *Bloomberg*, August 9, 2021.

Sui-Lee Wee, "China Says It Will Provide 2 Billion Vaccine Doses to the World. The Pledge, Which Included a \$100 Million Donation to Covax, Intensifies Competition with the U.S. over Leadership in Ending the Pandemic," *New York Times*, August 6 (updated August 9), 2021.

Julian E. Barnes, "Russian Disinformation Targets Vaccines and the Biden Administration, A New Campaign Appears to be Spreading Falsehoods about the Potential for Forced Inoculations Against Covid-19," *New York Times*, August 5 (updated September 20), 2021.

Jonathan Barrett, "Biden Pledges 'No Strings' Pacific Pandemic Support," *Reuters*, August 5, 2021.

Nick Baker, "China Has Accused Australia of Vaccine Sabotage in the Pacific. Here's why, A Spat Between China and Australia over Covid-19 Vaccines Highlights the Tense Geopolitics of the Pacific Region," *NBC News*, August 2, 2021.

Jake Rudnitsky, "Russia's Global Vaccine Ambitions Stumble During Supply Shortage," *Bloomberg*, July 30, 2021.

Benjamin Ho, "Why China Will Not Cooperate with the West: The Pandemic Made Things Worse, Beijing Sees Vaccine Diplomacy as a Crucial Means with Which to Convince Other Countries of Its Goodwill and Friendship. It Wants to Seize the Moral High Ground to Claim that It Is Superior to the West," *National Interest*, July 25, 2021.

By Samuel Ramani, "Vaccines Are Japan's New Tool to Counter China, Despite Its Worsening Pandemic, Tokyo's Vaccine Diplomacy Has Gained Traction," *Foreign Policy*, July 23, 2021.

Julia Hollingsworth and Ben Westcott, "A Pacific Nation's Covid-19 Crisis Has Become a Political Power Play between China and Australia," *CNN*, July 19, 2021.

Chloe Lim And Nile Bowie, "China's Vaccine Diplomacy Falters in SE Asia, Regional Nations Are Abandoning Chinese Vaccines for Western Ones as Evidence Mounts Sinovac Is Less Potent Against the Delta Strain," *Asia Times*, July 19, 2021.

Josh Rogin, "China's Vaccine Profiteering at the U.N. Is Being Funded by U.S. Taxpayers," *Washington Post*, July 15, 2021.

R. Evan Ellis, "Vaccine Diplomacy in Latin America, Caribbean a PR Coup for China," *National Defense*, July 12, 2021.

Robbie Gramer, "U.S. Blunts China's Vaccine Diplomacy in Latin America, The Biden Administration Ships Millions of Vaccines to the Region As Its Public Health Crisis Worsens," *Foreign Policy*, July 9, 2021.

Alexey Kovalev, "The Shocking Enormity of Russia's Botched Pandemic Response, A Massive Third Wave Is Spreading Unchecked, Anti-vaxxers Are Rampant, and the Kremlin's Vaccine Diplomacy has failed," *Foreign Policy*, July 5, 2021.

Tyler Durden, "How China Became The Big Winner Of The COVID Era," *ZeroHedge*, July 3, 2021.

Sinikukka Saari, *Russia's Corona Diplomacy and Geoeconomic Competition, A Sputnik Moment?* Finnish Institute of International Affairs, July 2021, 8 pp.

Rintaro Hosokawa, "Vaccines and Rifts Dominate First G-20 Ministers Meeting in 2 Years Chinese FM Calls on Countries to Stop 'Export Restrictions and Excessive Hoarding," *Nikkei Asia*, June 30, 2021.

Shaun Tandon and Gildas Le Roux (Agence France-Presse), "US Urges Covid Cooperation at G20 as China Critical," *Yahoo News*, June 29, 2021.

Koji Sugimoto and George Yin, "With Vaccine Diplomacy to Taiwan, U.S. and Japan Steal March on China, Vaccine Diplomacy Is Not Just About Winning 'Hearts and Minds' but Also *Realpolitik*," *National Interest*, June 28, 2021.

Samuel Ramani, "With Sputnik V, Russia Shot Itself in the Foot, High Prices, Delayed Deliveries, and Questions About Efficacy Raise Suspicions about Russia's Vaccine Diplomacy in Africa," *Foreign Policy*, June 24, 2021.

Reuben Johnson, "COVID, Hacking, and Spying Helped China Develop a New Stealth Fighter in Record Time, In the West, the Pandemic Put the Defense Industry on Hold. In China, the Military Used the Time to Make Big Advances," *Bulwark*, June 23, 2021.

Deborah Seligsohn, "Demands for a Lab Leak Investigation Are a Dangerous Distraction, U.S.-China Cooperation Is Vital for Global Health Efforts," *Foreign Policy*, June 18, 2021.

Josh Rogin, "To Push Back Against Chinese Aggression, Give Taiwan Vaccines," *Washington Post*, June 17 (updated June 25), 2021.

Niharika Mandhana and Sha Hua, "China Steps Into Covid-19 Vaccine Void in Asia's Developing Nations, Shots Developed by Chinese Companies Have Been a Conspicuous Part of the Rollouts in the First Half of 2021, Helping Beijing Strengthen Regional Ties," *New York Times*, June 16, 2021.

Oliver Stuenkel, "Vaccine Diplomacy Boosts China's Standing in Latin America, Beijing Has Increased Its Leverage in the Region—but Washington Can Still Stage a Comeback," *Foreign Policy*, June 11, 2021.

Jack Detsch, "U.S.-China Spat Over Taiwan Extends to Vaccine Diplomacy, The United States Is Providing Hundreds of Thousands of Vaccines Right in China's Front Yard," *Foreign Policy*, June 11, 2021.

Matthew Dalton, "France Suspects Russian Role in Campaign to Discredit Pfizer Vaccine, Several French Bloggers Said They Received Emails Offering to Pay for Social-Media Videos Criticizing the Covid-19 Vaccine," *Wall Street Journal*, May 25, 2021.

Dan De Luce, "China is Using Vaccines to Push Its Agenda in Latin America, and the U.S. Is Behind the Curve, Experts Say, Latin American Officials Say China Has Pushed Their Countries to Cut Ties with Taiwan in Return for Badly Needed Covid-19 Vaccines," *NBC News*, May 23, 2021.

Michael Martina, "U.S. Says Condemns Political Use of Vaccines after China-Taiwan Tussle," *Reuters*, May 14, 2021.

Ben Westcott, "China and Russia Want to Vaccinate the Developing World Before the West. It's Brought Them Closer Than Ever," *CNN*, May 11, 2021.

Meia Nouwens, *The Evolving Nature of China's Military Diplomacy: From Visits to Vaccines*, International Institute for Strategic Studies (IISS), May 2021, 15 pp. (Posted online May 10, 2021.)

Iain Marlow, Sudhi Ranjan Sen, and James Paton, "World Turns to China for Vaccines After India, U.S. Stumble," *Bloomberg*, May 6 (updated May 7), 2021.

Nicholas G. Evans and Mark Eccleston-Turner, "COVID-19 Vaccine Nationalism Will Cost Lives Worldwide," *Slate*, May 3, 2021.

Krishna Kumar, "Why America Must Do More to Vaccinate the World's Population," *National Interest*, May 3, 2021.

Andrew Higgins, "Russian Attempts to Expand Sputnik Vaccine Set Off Discord in Europe," *New York Times*, May 2 (updated May 5), 2021.

Miriam Matthews, Katya Migacheva, and Ryan Andrew Brown, *Superspreaders of Malign and Subversive Information on COVID-19, Russian and Chinese Efforts Targeting the United States*, RAND, 2021, 82 pp.

Euronews, "EU Slams Russia and China for Western Vaccines Disinformation Campaign," *Euronews*, April 29, 2021.

Robin Emmott, "Russia, China sow disinformation to undermine trust in Western vaccines: EU," *Reuters*, April 28, 2021.

Akhil Ramesh, "On Vaccines, Globalists Are Nationalists and Nationalists Are Gobalists," *The Hill*, April 27, 2021.

Josh Rogin, "The United States Can't Ignore China's Vaccine Diplomacy in Latin America," *Washington Post*, April 22, 2021.

Georgia Leatherdale-Gilholy, "Could India's Vaccine Diplomacy Displace China?" *National Interest*, April 20, 2021.

Harsh V. Pant and Premesha Saha, "India's Vaccine Diplomacy Reaches Taiwan," *National Interest*, April 20, 2021.

Hal Brands, "America's Come-From-Behind Pandemic Victory, China Was the Global Winner of the Coronavirus Disaster—Until the United States Beat the Odds," *Foreign Policy*, April 16, 2021.

Eckart Woertz and Roie Yellinek, "Vaccine Diplomacy in the MENA Region," Middle East Institute, April 14, 2021.

Dalibor Rohac, "Sputnik V's Biggest Legacy May Be Political Turmoil, In Eastern European Countries That Have Accepted the Russian Vaccine, Destabilization Has Followed," *Foreign Policy*, April 14, 2021.

Cecilia Yap and Andreo Calonzo, "Philippines Asks U.S. for Vaccine Help as China Tensions Grow," *Bloomberg*, April 11, 2021.

Reuters Staff, "Taiwan Says China Uses COVID-19 Vaccines to Press Paraguay to Break Ties," *Reuters*, April 7, 2021. (See also Bill Bostock, "Taiwan Accused China of Trying to Bribe Paraguay with COVID-19 Vaccines to Make It Stop Recognizing Taiwan," *Business Insider*, April 7, 2021; *Agence France-Presse*, "Taiwan Accuses Beijing of Luring Paraguay with 'Vaccine Diplomacy," *France 24*, April 7, 2021; BBC, "Taiwan Accuses China of 'Vaccine Diplomacy' in Paraguay," *BBC*, April 7, 2021.)

Reuters Staff, "Taiwan Says India Helped Paraguay Get Vaccines After China Pressure," *Reuters*, April 7, 2021.

Luke McGee, "Europe Is Torn Over Whether to Take Putin's Help on Vaccines," CNN, April 3, 2021.

Georgi Kantchev and Laurence Norman, "With EU's Covid-19 Vaccine Drive in Disarray, Russia Sees an Opening, Despite Tensions with Moscow, Some EU Leaders Back the Sputnik V Shot, Which Could Offer Kremlin a Soft Power Coup," *Wall Street Journal*, April 2, 2021.

Tim Gosling, "Russia and China Are Exploiting Europe's Vaccine Shortfalls, Slovakia's Prime Minister Has Resigned Over a Secret Delivery of Moscow's Sputnik V as Brussels Struggles to Keep the EU United," *Foreign Policy*, March 31, 2021.

Yasmeen Serhan, "Here's How Russia and China Are Helping the U.S., Beijing and Moscow Are Filling the Vaccine Gap That Wealthy Countries Helped Create," *Atlantic*, March 30, 2021.

Hal Brands, "America Is Overtaking China in Vaccine Diplomacy, China Squandered Its Early Advantages, and Now the U.S. Government and Drug Makers Are Leading a Second-Half Comeback," *Bloomberg*, March 23, 2021.

Erik Brattberg, "Middle Power Diplomacy in an Age of US-China Tensions," *Washington Quarterly*, Spring 202: 219-238. (Published online March 23, 2021.)

Otto Lanzavecchia, "Old Friends in Italy Join Russia's Vaccine Offensive," Center for European Policy Analysis (CEPA), March 19, 2021.

Sadanand Dhume, "India Beats China at Vaccine Diplomacy, But New Delhi's Massive Success Is a Function of Collaboration with the West, Not 'Self-Reliance," *Wall Street Journal*, March 18, 2021.

Austin Bay, "On Point: Russia Joins China's Wuhan Virus Lie Campaign," Strategy Page, March 17, 2021.

John Bowden, "Kremlin: Pressure on Countries to Refuse Russian COVID-19 Vaccine 'Quite Unprecedented," *The Hill*, March 16, 2021.

John Grady, "SOUTHCOM's Faller: China Used Pandemic to Expand 'Corrosive, Insidious Influence' in Central, South America, U.S. Influence 'Eroding,'" *USNI News*, March 16 (updated March 17), 2021.

Jeff Pao, "China, Quad Slug It Out in Vaccine Diplomacy Fight, Beijing and Washington Use Low-Cost Vaccines to Win Hearts and Minds in Poor and Under-Developed Countries," *Asia Times*, March 16, 2021.

Daniele Carminati, "The Ups and Downs of Soft Power in the Asia-Pacific, The Coronavirus Pandemic Has Shifted the Relative 'Soft power' Standing of Leading Powers," *Diplomat*, March 15, 2021.

Ernesto Londoño and Letícia Casado, "Brazil Needs Vaccines. China Is Benefiting, China Is a Major Supplier of Coronavirus Vaccine, Giving It Enormous Leverage in Pandemic-Ravaged Nations. Brazil, Recently Hostile to the Chinese Company Huawei, Has Suddenly Changed Its Stance," *New York Times*, March 15, 2021.

Edward Lucas, Jake Morris, and Corina Rebegea, *Information Bedlam: Russian and Chinese Information Operations During Covid-19*, Center for European Policy Analysis (CEPA), 2021, 20 pp. (Posted online March 15, 2021.)

Eric Bellman, "U.S. Taps Indian Covid-19 Vaccine Production Prowess to Inoculate Indo-Pacific," *Wall Street Journal*, March 14, 2021.

Nathaniel Weixel, "US Comes under Pressure to Share Vaccines with Rest of World," *The Hill*, March 14, 2021.

David Brunnstrom, Michael Martina, and Jeff Mason, "U.S., India, Japan and Australia Counter China with Billion-Dose Vaccine Pact," *Reuters*, March 12, 2021.

Michael J. Green, "Quad Summit's Vaccine Deal Is Biden's Bold First Move in Asia, It's a Smart Step to Counter China, but the Next Ones Won't Be as Easy," *Foreign Policy*, March 12, 2021.

Demetri Sevastopulo, Amy Kazmin, and Jamie Smyth, "US and Asia Allies Launch Major Vaccine Drive to Counter China, The 1bn Covid Jabs Will be Funded by US and Japan, Made in India and Distributed by Australia," *Financial Times*, March 12, 2021.

David Wainer and Patrick Gillespie, "It's 'America First' on Vaccines as Russia, China Fill Gap," *Bloomberg*, March 12, 2021.

Anne Gearan and Miriam Berger, "Biden Faces Pressure to Distribute Vaccines Worldwide, While Americans Still Need Them at Home," *Washington Post*, March 11, 2021.

Yanzhong Huang, "Vaccine Diplomacy Is Paying Off for China, Beijing Hasn't Won the Soft-Power Stakes, but It Has an Early Lead," *Foreign Affairs*, March 11, 2021.

Philip Blenkinsop, "Rich, Developing Nations Wrangle over COVID Vaccine Patents," *Reuters*, March 10, 2021.

Dinko Hanaan Dinko, "How 'Mask Diplomacy' Rescued China's Image in Africa, While Beijing Was Nimbly Pivoting, the U.S. Continued to Let Its Relationships Wither," *Defense One*, March 10, 2021.

Joel Gehrke, "US Eager to Beat China at Vaccine Diplomacy Game," *Washington Examiner*, March 10, 2021.

Rafi Khetab, "How America Can Outcompete China in an Age of Global Pandemics, Managing Pandemics Rightly Matters a Great Deal in This Era of Great Power Competition," *National Interest*, March 10, 2021.

Yomiuri Shimbun, "Quad to Create Framework for Providing Vaccines to Developing Countries," *Japan News*, March 10, 2021.

Henry Foy, "Covid Vaccine Diplomacy Is a Dilemma for Foreign Embassies in Russia, Sputnik V Is One of the Most Effective Jabs but the UK And US Are Flying in Their Own Supplies," *Financial Times*, March 9, 2021.

Prabhjote Gill, "India Is Asking the QUAD for Money to Boost Vaccine Production and Counter China's Moves on the Global Stage," *Business Insider India*, March 9, 2021.

Deirdre Shesgreen, "Russia Is Up to Its Old Tricks': Biden Battling COVID-19 Vaccine Disinformation Campaign," *USA Today*, March 8, 2021.

Nikolas K. Gvosdev and Ray Takeyh, "Who Came Out On Top from the 2020 Coronavirus Year? Predictions that Russia or China Would Take the Lead in the Fight against the Pandemic Have Not Panned Out. Instead, Countries Around the World Are Clamoring for Forging New Trade, Technological, and Health Alliances with the United States," *National Interest*, March 7, 2021.

Parag Khanna, "The New 'End of History,' If There Is a Political System that Has Emerged Victorious from the Coronavirus Pandemic, It Is Asian Democratic Technocracy," *National Interest*, March 6, 2021.

Lillian Posner, "The Controversy Behind Russia's Sputnik V Vaccine," *National Interest*, March 6, 2021.

Josh Rogin, "How Covid Hastened the Decline and Fall of the U.S.-China Relationship," *Washington Post*, March 4, 2021.

Krishna N. Das, "Chinese Hackers Target Indian Vaccine Makers SII, Bharat Biotech, Says Security Firm," *Reuters*, March 1, 2021.

Democracy, Authoritarianism, and Autocracy

Garance Burke, Josef Federman, Huizhong Wu, Krutika Pathi, and Rod Mcguirk, "Police Seize on COVID-19 Tech to Expand Global Surveillance," *Associated Press*, December 21, 2022.

Rachel Liang and Brian Spegele, "China Covid Protesters Become Targets of Beijing's Surveillance State," *Wall Street Journal*, November 29, 2022.

"How Dare They Peep into My Private Life?' Children's Rights Violations by Governments that Endorsed Online Learning During the Covid-19 Pandemic," Human Rights Watch, May 25, 2022.

Joel Simon and Robert Mahoney, "How China's Response to COVID-19 Set the Stage for a Worldwide Wave of Censorship, Authoritarian Governments in Eighty Nations Have Enacted Restrictions on Free Speech and Political Expression that Were Falsely Described as Public-Health Measures," *New Yorker*, April 25, 2022.

Ellen Francis, "Global Freedoms Have Hit a 'Dismal' Record Low, with Pandemic Restrictions Making Things Worse, Report Says," *Washington Post*, February 10, 2022.

Chris Buckley, Vivian Wang, and Keith Bradsher, "Living by the Code: In China, Covid-Era Controls May Outlast the Virus, The Country Has Instituted a Wide Range of High-Tech Controls on Society as Part of a Mostly Successful Effort to Stop the Virus. The Consequences May Endure," *New York Times*, January 30, 2022.

Sandra Ahmadi and Aseem Prakash, "Autocrats Are Exploiting COVID-19 to Weaken Central Bank Independence," *Foreign Policy*, January 10, 2022.

Victoria Kim, "Who's Watching? How Governments Used the Pandemic to Normalize Surveillance," *Los Angeles Times*, December 9, 2021.

Amnesty International, Silenced and Misinformed: Freedom of Expression in Danger During Covid-19, Amnesty International, 2021, 38 pp. (Posted online October 19, 2021.)

Justin Esarey, "The Myth That Democracies Bungled the Pandemic, The Argument that Authoritarian Governments Outperform Democracies in a Crisis Has Found New Life During the Coronavirus Pandemic. The Data Tell a Different Story," *Atlantic*, October 4, 2021.

Jill Lawless, "Authoritarianism Advances as World Battles the Pandemic," *Associated Press*, July 15, 2021.

Parag Khanna, "The Pandemic Proves Only Technocrats Can Save Us, Populist Politicians Love to Belittle Experts, but When It's a Matter of Life and Death, the Precautionary Principle and Expertise Are What Counts," *Foreign Policy*, June 24, 2021.

Uri Friedman, "COVID-19 Lays Bare the Price of Populism, A Raging Outbreak in Brazil Threatens Gains Against the Virus," *Atlantic*, May 9, 2021.

Camille Elemia, "At Least 10 Asia Pacific Gov'ts Use COVID-19 for Censorship, Disinformation," *Rappler*, April 20, 2021.

R. Evan Ellis, *Populism, China, and Covid-19, Latin America's New Perfect Storm*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), April 2021, 6 pp. (Posted online April 20, 2021.)

Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, "Governments In Europe, Central Asia Used Pandemic To Clamp Down On Human Rights, Amnesty Says," *Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty*, April 7, 2021.

Elian Peltier, "Laws Used to Fight Pandemic Are in Some Cases Weakening Democracies, Report Says," *New York Times*, March 9, 2021.

Parag Khanna, "The New 'End of History,' If There Is a Political System that Has Emerged Victorious from the Coronavirus Pandemic, It Is Asian Democratic Technocracy," *National Interest*, March 6, 2021.

Joshua Kurlantzick, COVID-19 and Its Effect on Inequality and Democracy, A Study of Five Large Democracies, Council on Foreign Relations, March 2021, 36 pp.

"Covid-19 Triggers Wave of Free Speech Abuse, Scores of Countries Target Media, Activists, Medics, Political Opponents," Human Rights Watch, February 11, 2021.

Economist, "Global Democracy Has a Very Bad Year, The Pandemic Caused an Unprecedented Rollback of Democratic Freedoms in 2020," *Economist*, February 2, 2021.

Societal Tension, Reform, and Transformation, and Governmental Stability

Lynette H. Ong, "China's Epidemic of Mistrust, How Xi's COVID-19 U-Turn Will Make the Country Harder to Govern," *Foreign Affairs*, January 11, 2023.

Yew Lun Tian and Martin Pollard, "China Protests Highlight Xi's COVID Policy Dilemma," *Reuters*, November 29, 2022.

Daisuke Wakabayashi, Olivia Wang, and Joy Dong, "Chinese Protests Over 'Zero Covid' Follow Months of Economic Pain," *New York Times*, November 29, 2022.

CNN's Beijing bureau and Nectar Gan, "Protests Erupt Across China in Unprecedented Challenge to Xi Jinping's Zero-Covid Policy," CNN, November 28, 2022.

Dake Kang, "China's Xi Faces Threat from Public Anger over 'Zero COVID," Associated Press, November 28, 2022.

Cao Li and Elaine Yu, "China Clamps Down on Protesters Against Zero-Covid Policies," *Wall Street Journal*, November 28, 2022.

Minxin Pei, "Xi Jinping Has a Tough Decision to Make on China's COVID Protests, Ending Lockdowns and Cracking Down Would Both Have High Costs," *Nikkei Asia*, November 28, 2022.

Lingling Wei, "Chinese Protests Put Xi Jinping in a Bind, Lifting Restrictions Would Risk a Wave of Covid Infections, While Crushing Demonstrations Would Have Uncertain Consequences," *New York Times*, November 28, 2022.

Lingling Wei, Brian Spegele, and Wenxin Fan, "Chinese Protests Spread Over Government's Covid Restrictions, Demonstrations Erupt in Beijing, Shanghai and Other Major Cities," *Wall Street Journal*, November 28, 2022.

Edward White, Thomas Hale, and Ryan McMorrow, "Xi Jinping Faces Stiffest Challenge to Rule as Covid Outrage Sparks Mass Protests," *Financial Times*, November 28, 2022.

Editorial Board, "China's Revolt Against Zero-Covid, Protests across the Country Reveal Deep Anger and Frustration at Three Years of Lockdowns and Social Control," *Wall Street Journal*, November 27, 2022.

Chris Buckley and Muyi Xiao, "Protests Erupt in Shanghai and Other Chinese Cities Over Covid Controls," *New York Times*, November 26, 2022.

Editorial Board, "China's Zero-Covid Reckoning, Record Infections and New Lockdowns Lead to Rising Public Frustration and Slower Economic Growth," *Wall Street Journal*, November 24, 2022.

Christopher Chen, "Future-ready Humanitarian Action: Strategic Resilience in a Post-Covid World," S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies (RSIS), December 16, 2021.

Benoit Faucon, Summer Said, and Joe Parkinson, "Military Coups in Africa at Highest Level Since End of Colonialism, Attempted or Successful Coups in Africa Are Occurring More Frequently as Democratic States Buckle under Pressure from Covid-19," *Wall Street Journal*, November 4, 2021.

Carnegie Civic Research Network, *Civil Society and the Global Pandemic: Building Back Different?* Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, September 2021, 19 pp. (Posted online September 30, 2021.)

Peter Landers, Mike Cherney, and Jon Emont, "Covid-19 Delta Infections Trigger Political Side Effects in Asia, Voters Are Directing Their Dissatisfaction at Leaders They Believe Responded Too Slowly to the Variant's Spread," *Wall Street Journal*, August 26, 2021.

Joe Parkin Daniels, "The Pandemic's Legacy Will Spur New Protests in Latin America, Increased Economic Inequality Has Only Added to Widespread Discontent," *Foreign Policy*, July 29, 2021.

Elise Labott, "Get Ready for a Spike in Global Unrest, COVID-19 Threatens to Accelerate Longer-Term Rebellion, Violence, and Political Upheaval," *Foreign Policy*, July 22, 2021.

Paolo Gerbaudo, "Big Government Is Back, The Pandemic Has Discredited Decades of Free Market Orthodoxy—But Not All Visions of State Interventionism Are Progressive," *Foreign Policy*, February 13, 2021.

Emeline Wuilbercq, "Pandemic Woes Seen Swelling Global Ranks of Child Soldiers," *Reuters*, February 12, 2021.

Alexander Villegas, Anthony Faiola, and Lesley Wroughton, "As Spending Climbs and Revenue Falls, the Coronavirus Forces a Global Reckoning, A Rising 'Debt Tsunami' Threatens Even Stable, Peaceful Middle-Income Countries," *Washington Post*, January 10, 2021.

Edoardo Campanella, "The Pandemic Remade the Chinese Economy, Other Countries Should Prepare Now for Their Own Reformations," *Foreign Policy*, January 4, 2021.

Philip Barrett and Sophia Chen, *Social Repercussions of Pandemics*, International Monetary Fund, IMF Working Paper WP/21/21, January 2021, 24 pp.

Jarrett Blanc, Frances Z. Brown, and Benjamin Press, "Conflict Zones in the Time of Coronavirus: War and War by Other Means," Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, December 17, 2020.

Tahsin Saadi Sedik and Rui Xu, "When Inequality is High, Pandemics Can Fuel Social Unrest," IMF Blog (International Monetary Fund), December 11, 2020.

Joaquín Cottani, *The Effects of Covid-19 on Latin America's Economy*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), November 2020, 9 pp.

Tomasz Mickiewicz, Jun Du, and Oleksandr Shepotylo, "Coronavirus: Individualistic Societies Might Be Doing Worse, the Individualism Hypothesis Is Worth Investigating Further," *National Interest*, October 14, 2020.

Clare Duffy, "The Pandemic Could Push 150 Million More People Worldwide into 'Extreme Poverty," *CNN Business*, October 7, 2020.

World Economy, Globalization, and U.S. Trade Policy

Patricia Cohen, "Chinese Unrest Over Lockdown Upends Global Economic Outlook," *New York Times*, November 28, 2022.

Jason Douglas and Stella Yifan Xie, "Pandemic Bolsters China's Position as the World's Manufacturer, The West Relies on Chinese Factories, Despite National-Security, Supply-Chain Concerns," *Wall Street Journal*, August 21, 2022.

Ben Casselman and Ana Swanson, "Supply Chain Hurdles Will Outlast Pandemic, White House Says," *New York Times*, April 14, 2022.

Valbona Zeneli, "After Ukraine and Coronavirus, Globalization Should Be About Freedom," *National Interest*, April 8, 2022.

Edward Wong and Ana Swanson, "Ukraine War and Pandemic Force Nations to Retreat From Globalization," *New York Times*, March 22, 2022.

Damien Cave and Christopher F. Schuetze, "Contending With the Pandemic, Wealthy Nations Wage Global Battle for Migrants, Covid Kept Many People in Place. Now Several Developed Countries, Facing Aging Labor Forces and Worker Shortages, Are Racing to Recruit, Train and Integrate Foreigners," *New York Times*, November 23, 2021.

Megan Greene, "Don't Believe the Deglobalisation Narrative, Data Show Trade Balances Are Not Shrinking and Foreign Investment Continues to Pour into China," *Financial Times*, November 16, 2021.

Rajiv Shah, "Rich Countries Saved Themselves During the Pandemic. Poorer Countries Are Reeling. Developing Countries Had Been Closing the Gap with Wealthier Nations for Decades. When Covid-19 Hit, That Stopped," *Washington Post*, October 22, 2021.

Zack Beauchamp, "'Neoliberalism Has Really Ruptured': Adam Tooze on the Legacy of 2020, The Global Aftershocks of Covid-19 and the Economic Crisis It Caused, Explained," *Vox*, September 9, 2021.

Editorial Board, "China's Changing Role in the World Economy, Delta Variant and Supply Chain Problems Are Slowing the Global Recovery," *Economist*, September 1, 2021.

Peter S. Goodman and Keith Bradsher, "The World Is Still Short of Everything. Get Used to It. Pandemic-Related Product Shortages—from Computer Chips to Construction Materials—Were Supposed to Be Resolved by Now. Instead, the World Has Gained a Lesson in the Ripple Effects of Disruption," *New York Times*, August 30 (updated September 23), 2021.

Emily Rauhala, Anu Narayanswamy, Youjin Shin, and Júlia Ledur, "How the Pandemic Set Back Women's Progress in the Global Workforce," *Washington Post*, August 28, 2021.

Jayati Ghosh, "Specter of Stagflation Hangs Over Emerging Markets, Rich Countries' Pandemic Policies Are Sucking Growth and Capital Out of the Developing World," *Foreign Policy*, August 5, 2021.

Gabriele Steinhauser and Drew Hinshaw, "India's Covid-19 Agonies Highlight Growing Rich-Poor Gap in Vaccinations," *Wall Street Journal*, April 27, 2021.

James K. Galbraith, "The Death of Neoliberalism Is Greatly Exaggerated, The West's Economic Orthodoxy of the Past 40 Years Has Been Shaken by the Pandemic—But the Fight Isn't Nearly Over Yet," *Foreign Policy*, April 6, 2021.

Nita Bhalla, "Africans Slam Rich Nations For Blocking Access To Generic COVID Vaccines," *Reuters*, March 11, 2021.

Colm Quinn, "Rich vs. Poor (Again) at WTO, Months after India and South Africa Made Their Initial Proposal, the World Trade Organization Has Another Chance to Waive Intellectual Property Rights for Covid-19 Vaccines and Treatments," *Foreign Policy*, March 10, 2021.

Scott Lincicome, "The Pandemic Does Not Demand Government Micromanagement of Global Supply Chains," Cato Institute, February 24, 2021.

Fatima Hassan, "Don't Let Drug Companies Create a System of Vaccine Apartheid, To Avoid Repeating the Pitfalls of the HIV/AIDS Crisis, Governments and the WTO Must Make COVID-19 Vaccination a Public Good by Temporarily Waiving Intellectual Property Rights and Compelling Emergency Production," *Foreign Policy*, February 23, 2021.

Peter S. Goodman, "One Vaccine Side Effect: Global Economic Inequality, As Covid Inoculations Begin, the Economic Downturn Stands to be Reversed, but Developing Countries Are at Risk of Being Left Behind," *New York Times*, December 25, 2020.

Michael Shields, "Pandemic Speeds Labour Shift from Humans to Robots, WEF Survey Finds," *Reuters*, October 20, 2020.

Scott Lincicome, "Why a Successful COVID-19 Vaccine Depends on Globalization, Each of the Vaccines that the United States Has Secured Appears to be Heavily Reliant on Globalization to Produce the Final Doses at the Absolute Maximum Speed and Scale," *National Interest*, October 16, 2020.

Josh Zumbrun and Yuka Hayashi, "China Growth Limits Global Economic Damage From Pandemic, IMF Says," *Wall Street Journal*, October 13, 2020.

Eric K. Hontz, "The Fate of Globalization in the Post-Coronavirus Era," *National Interest*, September 12, 2020.

Niccolò Pisani, "Trump's China 'Decoupling' and Coronavirus: Why 2020 Upheaval Won't Kill Globalisation," *The Conversation*, September 9, 2020.

Carmen Reinhart and Vincent Reinhart, "The Pandemic Depression, The Global Economy Will Never Be the Same," *Foreign Affairs*, September/October 2020.

Anthony B. Kim, "Protectionism and the Pandemic Are Curtailing Global Trade. Policymakers Must Act Accordingly," Heritage Foundation, August 5, 2020.

Allied Defense Spending and U.S. Alliances

Amy Kazmin and Demetri Sevastopulo, "India's Covid Calamity Exposes Weakest Link in US-Led 'Quad' Alliance, New Delhi Virus Response Undermines Its Coalition with America, Japan and Australia to Resist China," *Financial Times*, June 14, 2021.

Michael Kugelman, "The U.S.-India Relationship Has a New Top Priority, The Indian Foreign Minister's U.S. Visit Shows the Partners Are Primarily Focused on Tackling the Coronavirus—for Now," *Foreign Policy*, May 27, 2021.

Tom Waldwyn and Fenella McGerty, "How COVID-19 Has Impacted South China Sea Defense Spending and Procurement," *Defense News*, May 10, 2021.

Mike Glenn, "COVID-19 Contributes to Jump in World's Military Budgets: Report," *Washington Times*, April 26, 2021.

Jeffrey Lightfoot and Olivier-Rémy Bel, Sovereign Solidarity, France, the US, and Alliances in a Post-Covid World, Atlantic Council, 2020 (released November 11, 2020), 28 pp.

Pierre Morcos, *Toward a New "Lost Decade"? Covid-19 and Defense Spending in Europe*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), October 2020, 7 pp. (Posted online October 15, 2020.)

Alice Billon-Galland, *COVID-19* and the Defence Policies of European States, NATO Defense College, October 2020, 4 pp.

Claudia Major, *Catalyst or Crisis? COVID-19 and European Security*, NATO Defense College, October 2020, 4 pp.

Olivier Rittimann, *NATO and the COVID-19 Emergency: Actions and Lessons, NATO Defense College*, September 2020, 4 pp.

European Union

Isaac Chotiner, "How the Pandemic Changed Europe, The historian Adam Tooze Discusses the Vaccine Rollout and Shifting Politics in the E.U.," *New Yorker*, April 15, 2021.

Steven Erlanger, "Vaccine 'Fiasco' Damages Europe's Credibility, The European Union's Failure to Secure Adequate Vaccine Supplies, Followed by an Export Ban, Has Dented the Reputation of the Bloc's Leaders. It May Also hurt their Ability to Act in Other Areas," *New York Times*, April 2, 2021.

Tim Gosling, "Russia and China Are Exploiting Europe's Vaccine Shortfalls, Slovakia's Prime Minister Has Resigned Over a Secret Delivery of Moscow's Sputnik V as Brussels Struggles to Keep the EU United," *Foreign Policy*, March 31, 2021.

Laurence Norman and Jenny Strasburg, "Vaccine Fight Between EU and U.K. Threatens to Escalate, Officials on Both Sides Are in Talks to Prevent Bans of Exports of Covid-19 Shots and Vaccination Supplies," *Wall Street Journal*, Updated March 22, 2021.

Caroline de Gruyter, "Europe Needed Borders. Coronavirus Built Them. The Pandemic Has the Continent Increasingly Discussing Its Common Boundaries—and Common Identity," *Foreign Policy*, December 4, 2020.

Colm Quinn, "Can Europe Come Together to Save Itself? A Quarrel over the EU Coronavirus Fund Threatens to Stall Economic Recovery Efforts," *Foreign Policy*, November 19, 2020.

Joseph de Weck and Elettra Ardissino, "The Pandemic Is Showing What the EU Is Good For," *Foreign Policy*, September 8, 2020.

Adam Tooze, "It's a New Europe—if You Can Keep It, The Continent Has Managed to Take a Great Leap Forward—But There Still Might Be a Crash Landing," *Foreign Policy*, August 7, 2020.

Editorial Board, "The Pandemic Has Made Europe Stronger," Washington Post, July 28, 2020.

Joseph de Weck, "Germany Is Finally Ready to Spend, In the Long Run, the COVID-19 Pandemic May Change Europe's Economy for the Better," *Foreign Policy*, June 22, 2020.

Patrick Donahue and Arne Delfs, "Merkel Calls for Agreement on EU Fund Before Summer Break," *Bloomberg*, June 18, 2020.

Desmond Lachman, "A Eurozone Economic Crisis Thanks to Coronavirus?" *National Interest*, June 2, 2020.

Definition of, and Budgeting for, U.S. National Security

Josh Kerbel, "The US Talks A Lot About Strategic Complexity. Too Bad It's Mostly Just Talk, The Pandemic Sidelined a National Security Community that Gives Only Lip Service to a Vital Concept," *Defense One*, March 9, 2021.

Susan B. Glasser, "What Does National Security Even Mean Anymore, After January 6th and the Pandemic? Talking Threats, Foreign and Domestic, with Mark Milley, the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff," *New Yorker*, March 4, 2021.

Jacob Parakilas, "The Lesson of 2020? Security Doesn't Mean What You Think It Does, And Science and Technology Will Only Take Us So Far When It Comes to Future Threats, Conventional or Otherwise," *Diplomat*, December 23, 2020.

Patrick M. Cronin and Audrey Kurth Cronin, "Rebuilding America in the Post Trump Era, The Trump Administration's Woeful Response to Many Threats, but Especially the Coronavirus Pandemic, Demonstrates that Dealing with Tomorrow's Bioterror Threat Must be a National Security Priority," *National Interest*, December 18, 2020.

Kevin Bilms, "Will COVID Finally Force Us to Think Differently About National Security? The 'Softer' Approaches of Irregular War Offer Outsized Benefits During Competition and Armed Conflict Alike," *Defense One*, December 15, 2020.

Michael R. Gordon and Warren P. Strobel, "Coronavirus Pandemic Stands to Force Changes in U.S. Spy Services, After Years of Underplaying Soft Threats Like Disease and Climate Change, National-Security Establishment Faces Calls for a New Approach," *Wall Street Journal*, November 22, 2020.

Uri Firedman, "The Pandemic Is Revealing a New Form of National Power, In the COVID-19 Era, a Country's Strength Is Determined Not Only by Its Military and Economy, but Also by Its Resilience," *Atlantic*, November 15, 2020.

Frank Hoffman, "National Security in the Post-Pandemic Era," *Orbis*, Winter 2021: 17-45. (The first page of the article carries an additional date of November 2020.)

Marigny Kirschke-Schwartz, "America Must Act To Avoid A Biotechnology Arms Race, the Covid-19 Pandemic Has Shown Us the Potential for a Biological Incident to Upend Global Stability, and the Implications Are Sobering," *National Interest*, September 22, 2020.

Calder Walton, "US Intelligence, the Coronavirus and the Age of Globalized Challenges," Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs, August 24, 2020.

U.S. Defense Strategy, Defense Budget, and Military Operations

Frank Hoffman, "U.S. Defense Strategy After The Pandemic," War on the Rocks, April 20, 2021.

Aaron Mehta, "After COVID, Are Billions in Biodefense Funds Needed to Deter US Adversaries?" *Defense News*, April 9, 2021.

America's Strategic Choices: Defense Spending in a Post-Covid-19 World, An Executive Outbrief From The CSBA-Ronald Reagan Institute Defense Worskhops, Center for Strategic and Budgetary Assessments, January 2021, 13 pp.

Tony Bertuca, "Lord Says Pandemic Sharpened DOD's Focus on Re-Shoring, Especially Microelectronics," *Inside Defense*, September 29, 2020.

Mike Glenn, "Don't Pay for COVID-19 Relief at Expense of Nation's Defense, Esper Warns," *Washington Times*, September 24, 2020.

Mackenzie Eaglen, "More Safety for Less Security Is a Sucker Bet," American Enterprise Institute, September 3, 2020.

Jon Harper, "Army a Potential Bill Payer for COVID-19 Costs," *National Defense*, August 18, 2020.

Matt Vallone, "U.S. Defense Spending During and After the Pandemic," War on the Rocks, July 31, 2020.

Franklin C. Miller, "Never Let a Good Crisis Go to Waste," Real Clear Defense, June 1, 2020.

U.S. Foreign Assistance, International Debt Relief, and Refugee Policy

Meghan Benton, *Future Scenarios for Global Mobility in the Shadow of Pandemic*, Migration Policy Institute, July 2021, 33 pp.

Catherine Osborn, "How to Escape the COVID-19 Debt Trap, This Crisis May Be a Turning Point for How the IMF Treats Indebted Nations.," *Foreign Policy*, June 4, 2021.

Bernard Aryeetey, "G20 Debt Relief for Poor Nations Means COVID Healthcare Investment," *Thomson Reuters Foundation News*, April 7, 2021.

Gabriele Steinhauser and Joe Wallace, "Africa's First Pandemic Default Tests New Effort to Ease Debt From China, Effort to Ensure that China and Bondholders Participate in Debt Restructurings Could Help Resolve Zambia's Default," *Wall Street Journal*, November 18, 2020.

Dan Runde, Conor Savoy, and Shannon McKeown, *Post-pandemic Governance in the Indo-Pacific, Adapting USAID's Strategy in the Face of Covid-19*, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), September 2020, 11 pp. (Posted online September 25, 2020.)

Sam Denney and Kemal Kirisci, "COVID-19 and the Chance to Reform U.S. Refugee Policy," *Lawfare*, August 18, 2020.

Daniel F. Runde, "USAID Should Lead Global Pandemic Response in an Age of Great Power Competition," *The Hill*, August 17, 2020.

Rayn Ellis, "Conservative Foreign Aid Can Strengthen US Interests in the Coronavirus Recovery," *Washington Examiner*, August 11, 2020.

Jamille Bigio and Haydn Welch, "As the Global Economy Melts Down, Human Trafficking Is Booming," *Foreign Policy*, August 10, 2020.

Zuhumnan Dapel, "It Is Too Late to Save These Victims of the Pandemic, The COVID-19 Catastrophe Is Shrinking Remittances from the United States and Creating a Looming Humanitarian Disaster," *Foreign Policy*, July 20, 2020.

Frances D'Emilio, "UN: Pandemic Could Push Tens of Millions into Chronic Hunger," *Associated Press*, July 13, 2020.

Emily Hawthorne, "COVID-19 Cash Shortages Will Cripple Global Humanitarian Efforts," *Stratfor*, June 30, 2020.

Olivia Enos, "The Danger for Refugees and the Most Vulnerable During COVID-19," Heritage Foundation, June 22, 2020.

Stephanie Segel, "International Financial Institutions Step Up, but Debt Sustainability Looms Large for Future Support," Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), May 21, 2020.

Joel Gehrke, "Fighting China with Foreign Aid: USAID Becomes a Critical Tool in Battle for World Influence," *Washington Examiner*, May 10, 2020.

Michael H. Fuchs, Alexandra Schmitt, and Haneul Lee, "Foreign Aid is Critical to Stopping the Coronavirus," *National Interest*, May 3, 2020.

Daniel F. Runde, Conor M. Savoy, and Shannon McKeown, "Covid-19 Has Consequences for U.S. Foreign Aid and Global Leadership," Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), May 1, 2020.

Non-state Actors

John V. Parachini and Rohan Kumar Gunaratna, *Implications of the Pandemic for Terrorist Interest in Biological Weapons, Islamic State and al-Qaeda Pandemic Case Studies*, RAND, 2022, 59 pp.

Lindsey Kennedy and Nathan Paul Southern, "Endangered Species Are Paying the Price of COVID-19, Diminishing Tourism Has Created New Incentives for the Illegal Wildlife Trade," *Foreign Policy*, July 11, 2021.

Kieran Guilbert, "Traffickers Seen Thriving in Europe as COVID-19 Hits Victim Support," *Reuters*, April 9, 2021.

Charlie Mitchell, "Palo Alto Networks Report Explores 'Explosion' in Cloud Attacks Amid COVID-19 pandemic, *Inside Cybersecurity*," April 6, 2021

Michael King and Sam Mullins, "COVID-19 and Terrorism in the West: Has Radicalization Really Gone Viral?" *Just Security*, March 4, 2021.

Lindsey Kennedy and Nathan Paul Southern, "The Pandemic Is Putting Gangsters in Power, As States Struggle, Organized Crime Is Rising to New Prominence," *Foreign Policy*, February 15, 2021.

Lindsey Kennedy and Nathan Paul Southern, "How to Run a Criminal Network in a Pandemic, Drug Dealers and Human Traffickers Are Upgrading Their Marketing and Delivery Services," *Foreign Policy*, September 5, 2020.

Joby Warrick, "Covid-19 Pandemic Is Stoking Extremist Flames Worldwide, Analysts Warn," *Washington Post*, July 9, 2020.

Ioan Grillo, "How Mexico's Drug Cartels Are Profiting From the Pandemic," *New York Times*, July 7, 2020.

Edith M. Lederer, "UN Chief Warns COVID-19 Provides Opportunity for Terrorists," *Associated Press*, July 6, 2020.

Robin Simcox, "Terrorism After the Pandemic, Months of Isolation and Governments Grappling with Other Crises Could Lead to a Rise in Attacks," *Foreign Policy*, July 2, 2020.

Zachary Abuza and Alif Satria, "How Are Indonesia's Terrorist Groups Weathering the Pandemic?" *Diplomat*, June 23, 2020.

Camilo Tamayo Gomez, "Coronavirus: Drug Cartels Functioning as Governing Bodies Could Receive Popularity Boost," *National Interest*, June 23, 2020.

Simon Harding, "How Gangs and Drug Dealers Adapted to the Pandemic Reality," *National Interest*, June 22, 2020.

Nikita Malik, "How to Prepare for the Coronavirus's Impact on Terrorism," *National Interest*, June 21, 2020.

Anthony Faiola and Lucien Chauvin, "The Coronavirus Has Gutted the Price of Coca. It Could Reshape the Cocaine Trade," *Washington Post*, June 9, 2020.

Alexandra Lamarche, Arden Bentley, Rachel Schmidtke, and Sahar Atrache, "The Coronavirus Has Become Terrorists' Combat Weapon of Choice," *National Interest*, June 9, 2020.

U.S. Attention to International Issues Other than COVID-19

David Ignatius, "The Rest of the World Is Taking Advantage of a Distracted America," *Washington Post*, October 6, 2020.

David E. Sanger, Eric Schmitt and Edward Wong, "As Virus Toll Preoccupies U.S., Rivals Test Limits of American Power," *New York Times*, June 1 (updated June 2), 2020.

James Jay Carafano, "Amid Coronavirus, Global Challenges Remain for U.S.—Keep Eye on These 3 Hot Spots," Heritage Foundation, May 20, 2020.

Kathrin Hille, "Taiwan Fears Uptick in Military Threat from China in Wake of Coronavirus," *Financial Times*, May 18, 2020.

Steven Erlanger, "Will the Coronavirus Crisis Trump the Climate Crisis?" *New York Times*, May 9 (updated May 11), 2020.

Steve Mollman, "China's South China Sea Plan Unfolds Regardless of the Coronavirus," *Quartz*, May 9, 2020.

Thomas Spoehr, "U.S. Can't Afford to Take Its Eye off the Ball As National Threats Loom Beyond COVID-19," Heritage Foundation, May 8, 2020.

Arjun Kapur, "Scotland Launched an Invasion During the Black Death. Does History Tell China to Attack Taiwan?" *National Interest*, May 2, 2020.

Role of Congress

Daniel P. Vajdich, "Congress Has Been AWOL on U.S. Coronavirus Diplomacy, The Invisibility and Silence of Congress Is Another Reason for America's Shocking Abdication of Global Leadership," *Foreign Policy*, May 22, 2020.

George Ingram and Jeffrey L. Sturchio, "How Congress Can Address the International Dimensions of the COVID-19 Response," Brookings Institution, April 15, 2020.

Rob Berschinski and Benjamin Haas, "How Congress Can Save Lives, Protect Rights, and Exert U.S. Leadership Globally in Response to Coronavirus," *Just Security*, April 8, 2020.

Robbie Gramer and Jack Detsch, "Pandemic Stymies Congressional Check on Trump's Foreign Policy," *Foreign Policy*, April 8, 2020.

Author Information

Ronald O'Rourke Specialist in Naval Affairs

Acknowledgments

Original coauthors of this report were Michael Moodie, who was Assistant Director of the Foreign Affairs, Defense, and Trade Division of CRS and a Senior Specialist in Foreign Affairs, Defense, and Trade until his retirement from CRS in December 2020, and Kathleen J. McInnis, who was a Specialist in International Security in the Foreign Affairs, Defense, and Trade Division of CRS until April 15, 2022.

Disclaimer

This document was prepared by the Congressional Research Service (CRS). CRS serves as nonpartisan shared staff to congressional committees and Members of Congress. It operates solely at the behest of and under the direction of Congress. Information in a CRS Report should not be relied upon for purposes other than public understanding of information that has been provided by CRS to Members of Congress in connection with CRS's institutional role. CRS Reports, as a work of the United States Government, are not subject to copyright protection in the United States. Any CRS Report may be reproduced and distributed in its entirety without permission from CRS. However, as a CRS Report may include copyrighted images or material from a third party, you may need to obtain the permission of the copyright holder if you wish to copy or otherwise use copyrighted material.